

**CITY OF NEWARK
DELAWARE**

**PLANNING COMMISSION
PARKING SUBCOMMITTEE
MEETING MINUTES**

December 21, 2017

**Council Chamber
2:00 p.m.**

Present at the 2:00 p.m. meeting were:

Chair: Frank McIntosh

Committee Members Present: Rob Cappiello
Will Hurd
Chris Locke
Lee Mikles
Rich Rind
Alan Silverman

Committee Members Absent: Jordan Abada

Staff Present: Mary Ellen Gray, Planning and Development Director
Mike Fortner, Planner
Courtney Mulvanity, Parking Supervisor
Jay Hodny, IT GIS Technician

Mr. Frank McIntosh called the Parking Subcommittee meeting to order at 2:15 p.m.

1. CHAIR’S REMARKS

Mr. McIntosh: The meeting of the Parking Subcommittee of the Planning Commission will come to order, please. As the first order of business, I’d like to recommend an addition to the agenda. There’s been some talk about the GIS system that we have in place here in Newark which seems to me that there’s a lot that system might have to do with our discussions here, and it could, in fact, be a key component of them, maybe. So we have some people here today that can talk to us about that and give us a little bit of information. I thought it might be a good way to kind of kick this meeting off and give us some groundwork to move forward. So I’m placing into motion, I guess, the addition to the agenda, and that addition would be a presentation on the GIS system currently in place in Newark.

Mr. Alan Silverman: So moved.

Mr. Will Hurd: Second.

Mr. McIntosh: All in favor? Okay, I think we’ll make that #3. And so 3 will become 4; 4 will become 5; and 5 will become what?

Mr. Chris Locke: Six.

Mr. McIntosh: Good, Chris. I knew you could do it. I just knew it. I gave you a softball just to get us started.

Mr. Locke: I appreciate that.

Mr. McIntosh: Okay so that's that.

MOTION BY SILVERMAN, SECONDED BY HURD, THAT THE AGENDA OF THE DECEMBER 21, 2017 PARKING SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING BE AMENDED TO ADD AN INFORMATION SESSION ON CITY OF NEWARK GIS AS IT RELATES TO PARKING.

VOTE: 7-0

AYE: CAPPIELLO, HURD, LOCKE, MCINTOSH, MIKLES, RIND, SILVERMAN

NAY: NONE

ABSENT: ABADA

MOTION PASSED

Mr. McIntosh: I think we had some good work done at the last meeting and the feedback was very positive. We have some work yet to be done. We have the small group discussions that we'll be going into, and they will include the stormwater system, the economics of parking, the private lots that are available, independent lots that are available around town, and employee parking. We'll kind of put those last two together as something that seemed to make sense. And so those will be the three subgroups. Will will head up one of those groups, and that will be the stormwater. Alan will take the economics of parking, and I will be with the third group. We'll split up the committee except for you. You're going to be a stormwater person. Okay? Because last time you talked about the stormwater, so now you're on it. But we'll work that out when we get to that piece. We'll split up, and those of you who are in the audience are very welcome to join one or more . . . well you couldn't really do two . . . one of the groups. Just stick with one. And if we could split you up, that would be good so that there's four of you in the audience, so . . . you're all adults, you'll figure it out.

So that's really all I had to say. We will, at the end of the report-outs, I will ask the question, and that is, is there anything else that we missed? You know, we've been through this, is there something now, with the discussion we've had, is there anything we missed? We'll capture that if there is, and we will deal with it in January. If that is not the case, if everything is fine and we've got what we need, in January we'll take these solutions that we've been working on and try to make some sense of them, prioritize them, work them through, and prepare, basically, a report that will be finalized in February. And then we're done, good Lord willing and the creek don't rise. And the cows come home from pasture. Yes, Alan?

Mr. Silverman: Mr. Chairman . . .

Mr. Locke: The cows come home for milking. I think the saying is the cows come home for milking.

Mr. McIntosh: Not in Boston. In Boston, they come home from pasture.

Mr. Locke: In Brooklyn, they come home to milk.

Mr. McIntosh: Yes, Alan?

Mr. Silverman: You always have to bring religion into this, don't you? Oh, pasture . . . I'm sorry.

Mr. McIntosh: Pasture, not pastor.

Mr. Silverman: Okay. I'd like bring to your attention an exhibit prepared by staff which I think is very valuable. And just to save time in referencing, I'd like to make some suggestions. I'm color-blind, so I'm not going to refer to colors, but this side shows what I think is blue, are City owned or controlled lots. I'd label that side 1. On the flip side, where there's an additional

color, I'd label that side 2. And they are private . . . right, City owned or controlled and private lots. It's a very good illustration for reference for our group.

Mr. McIntosh: Thank you, Alan.

Mr. Silverman: And according to Mike, the data on here is circa 2016, so the numbers are relatively current. Thank you.

Mr. McIntosh: You're welcome.

2. MINUTES OF THE NOVEMBER 16, 2017 PARKING SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING

Mr. McIntosh: Did everybody receive the minutes? Hopefully you had a chance to read the book. It does take about a day or two. It's sort of like a short story that's morphing into a novel. It's on the edge. If I were an editor, I wouldn't be sure whether it's a short story or a novel. Are there any corrections to the minutes?

Ms. Michelle Vispi: None were received.

Mr. McIntosh: Okay. There being no correction to the minutes, I would accept a motion to accept the minutes.

Mr. Hurd: I move to accept the minutes as presented.

Mr. McIntosh: Wonderful. A second?

Mr. Rob Cappiello: Second.

Mr. McIntosh: Thank you. All in favor? Opposed?

Mr. Locke: I abstain because I didn't read them.

Mr. McIntosh: Well you can pretend.

Mr. Locke: It's 2,920 lines here. Holy cow. I abstain.

Mr. McIntosh: You're not filling the audience with confidence in anything you say.

Mr. Locke: I just want to be honest.

Mr. McIntosh: Well some things you just don't have to be honest about, right? You say I read them. I was in the bathroom for an extended period of time.

Ms. Mary Ellen Gray: Now that's too much information.

Mr. Locke: That is.

Mr. McIntosh: Well that's something that Chris would say. That's all.

MOTION BY HURD, SECONDED BY CAPPIELLO, THAT THE MINUTES OF THE NOVEMBER 16, 2017 PARKING SUBCOMMITTEE MEETING BE APPROVED.

VOTE: 6-0

AYE: CAPPIELLO, HURD, MCINTOSH, MIKLES, RIND, SILVERMAN

NAY: NONE

ABSENT: ABADA

ABSTAIN: LOCKE

MOTION PASSED

3. INFORMATION SESSION ON CITY OF NEWARK GIS AS IT RELATES TO PARKING [added November 16, 2017]

Mr. McIntosh: Anyway. Alright, so we have Item 3 on the agenda. Who is going to be reporting? Courtney?

Mr. Courtney Mulvanity: That would be me.

Mr. McIntosh: Alright, Courtney, the show is yours.

[Secretary's Note: During the informational session, Mr. Mulvanity referred to an online map being displayed for the benefit of the Parking Subcommittee and members of the audience.]

Mr. Mulvanity: First off, can everybody hear me okay with this mike back here?

Ms. Gray: Do you have a mike for the recording?

Mr. Mulvanity: I have this mike.

Ms. Gray: Okay.

Mr. McIntosh: This is the City calling me about some street.

Mr. Locke: Chapel Street is shut down at Main Street during the busiest time for Christmas shopping.

Mr. McIntosh: I know that. I just tried to get there.

Mr. Mulvanity: We're going to dim the lights for you guys so you can actually see what we're presenting to you today. Again, I'm Courtney Mulvanity. I'm the parking superintendent for the City of Newark, Delaware. I have with me today Jay Hodny. He is the GIS technician for the City of Newark. Marvin wishes he could be here today. Unfortunately he was unable to make it so I'm here in his place. First, I want to thank everybody on the subcommittee for allowing us the opportunity to show off our new map today. And this would give us an opportunity to get some input from you moving forward.

This is our new 2018 GIS parking map. This is not public as of yet. It's still a work in progress. It is replacing an old map which is actually the inventory of parking spaces downtown page that you guys already have. That is our old GIS map right there. What I want to show you today is the GIS map, how it works, and I will do that by demonstrating some of the lots and parking meters that we have.

So just to start off, this is the GIS map. It works just like the Google map or Bing map online. So you can easily move around using, pulling and dragging the map around. Clicking different items brings up different things here for you. I'm going to go through some of the aspects of the GIS map.

The first thing here is the legend. So everything you guys are seeing right now, there is a legend here. And this legend would tell you what each item is on the map. So you would . . . let's say hypothetically you're looking for two-hour parking meters. You would want to find it on the legend here and then you can select whatever area on the map that you want to go to to see the two-hour parking meters. As you can see here, we have two-hour parking meters on Main Street.

In addition to the legend, we can remove layers or add layers. Right now all of our layers are up. You can see they're all check-marked on the right there. Let's say, hypothetically, you don't want to see the residential parking zones on this map. You're just coming downtown to have dinner and residential parking zones really don't apply to you. You can uncheck this and it will get rid of those residential parking zones on the map.

We also have the search feature. Let's say you wanted to find the Newark Parking Office, which is at 45 East Main Street. You can go up in the top left-hand corner here and use the search feature, type in 45 East Main Street . . . and you do want to specify Newark, Delaware . . . and it should bring up, once the internet connects here, it should bring up where the Parking Office is. There we go. It will bring up the Parking Office, which you can see is right at Lot 1 here. And you can then zoom in on that, as well.

There are also different base maps you can use. So right now you're looking at . . . I believe this is the Bing map's overhead view. You can change these. Let's say you wanted the Bing map's street view. Overhead view doesn't work for you for whatever reason, you can see the street view, which is basically seeing East Delaware Avenue where it comes up big and bright for you. East Main Street is a little difficult to see because of all the single head meters that we have out here, but you can follow directions better with this map, for instance.

And then I want to get into the particulars of the map, and what we have on this particular map here. First off, this map shows all the parking operations within the City of Newark. This includes the residential areas, which I am now going to go and add back on. This includes the residential areas in blue. Then we have municipal parking lots. The hourly lots are green and the monthly lots are red. Let me move it so you can see Lot 5 down here. And then it also includes all on-street parking meters, as well. And those are actually signified individually for each meter on the street.

So, for instance, in Lots 1, 3, and 4, using the legend here, you can see that these are hourly parking lots. And let's just zoom in on Lot 1, for instance, would be a good one. If you click the information here, it will bring up info on the lot. And it does this for each individual lot. It shows location, number of spots, number of handicapped spots, parking rates, acceptable forms of payment in the parking lot, and any parking restrictions for the lot. In addition to that information there, we also have where pay stations are. For Lot 1 these are pay-on-feet, so somebody would actually walk up to a pay station here. We have one in the middle of the parking lot. There's also one in the Galleria. In Lots 3 and 4, these are actually cashiered parking lots. So you can see in Lot 3 here, we have two exits – the Main Street exit and the Center Street exit. For Lot 4, we only have one exit and that goes right out onto Center Street.

We also have monthly parking lots on here. We did try to color them so red means stop and green means go . . . at least to me . . . so monthly parking lots are shaded red, and they also have information. And when you click that information, it will show that this is a permit-only parking lot, for somebody that actually already has a monthly parking permit sticker for that lot.

In addition to that, we also have smart on-street parking meters, and there are three different specific kinds of meters in the City of Newark. The major one that we deal with often is the two-hour parking meters, and those are actually in blue here. If you click an individual meter, it will tell you the meter number and all the other stats on the meter. For instance, acceptable forms of payment, parking meter rates, time limit on the meter specifically, and then when they're functional.

In addition to our two-hours, we also have our loading zone meters, which are in the same area as the two-hour meters but there are additional restrictions on there. They're for commercial deliveries, tractor-trailers, so they're not parking within the driving lanes of Main Street. And we also have some on Center Street, as well, where we also get a lot of deliveries. We have 13 of those meters, and if you were to click one of these here, it would tell you the meter number and/or tell you that it's only operational from 4:00 p.m. to 2:00 a.m.

And, finally, we have our eight-hour meters over in the campus district. The only difference between these meters and the two-hour meters is pretty much the time limit. It still takes credit cards and coinage. It is an eight-hour meter. I know there was some confusion. They used to be four-hour meters until January. They are eight-hour meters now. If you stick your credit card in, it will start off as four hours but you're allowed to go up and down, and we did affix stickers to that to notify people when we made that change in an effort to move students out of Lot 1 and try to get them closer to the University over here. We figured raising that time limit would be advantageous for students. So that is the main difference there.

Other than that, on here we do have University of Delaware major garages. You can see here, for instance, is Trabant. We just pulled this from the website. Plus here is information from the website that we've added here for University of Delaware, for instance, Trabant. And then in the future what we'll want to do is actually have more surface lots for the University of Delaware, that way we can give a broader parking picture for anybody who would go to this map. We are going to add residential information moving forward. Right now we just have the zone shaded. But each individual zone sometimes has some quirks about it. So we want to add individual, specific information for each zone.

Other than that, some other ideas that have been floated is with IPS, who actually is our smart meter company. We want to . . . in the future, we are trying to work with them to see if there is any way we can show vacancy or occupancy for these meters on this map which would, I think, give a really good window into how busy our Main Street is for people prior to coming to downtown. And then we've floated the idea of if we could find a way to get the countdown signs to either connect or display on here for the parking lots. That would, again, give a window into how busy our lots and our parking meters are.

So I'm going to pass it back to you guys and open up discussion, suggestions or anything you have for us – me or Jay. We'll try to answer them as best as possible.

Mr. McIntosh: Okay. Thank you very much. Can we bring the lights back up, Michelle, please? Thank you. Alright, you had a question?

Mr. Locke: I did. Do you have individual data on each individual meter as to the sense of how much revenue it's generating on a daily basis?

Mr. Mulvanity: Yes. We can provide that information. It's actually through IPS, not connected to this map at all. But, yes, we do have that information. As far as with every meter, we do get revenue information on each individual meter. We can actually look it up to the transaction, but we need a sensor if we want to get occupancy information. It needs to be affixed with an actual in-ground sensor in the ground to get that information. So not every meter has that.

Mr. Locke: When you say occupancy, you mean how many cars are parked in that particular information . . .

Mr. Mulvanity: Right. Correct.

Mr. Locke: On a given day.

Mr. Mulvanity: Correct, we actually have occupancy reports that we do with the meters that already have the sensors on them. And they provide how often the meter is filled with a car, even if they don't pay. So that's one of the benefits of the sensors. Even if somebody hypothetically didn't pay the parking meter, I still know that they're there down the road. But when you don't a sensor, you simply have to go by the financial information from the meter.

Mr. Locke: And when you increased the four-hour parking meters to eight-hour parking meters, did you see any change in use or increase in revenue? Was there any delta when you changed it?

Mr. Mulvanity: Yes. We did see there was movement from Lot 1 to that campus district area. What really happened though, which was an unintended consequence, is what's happening here in Lot 1 . . . we also have Lot 6 right here, which has parking meters in it. Lot 6, because of Delaware Avenue, I hypothesize, if you're coming down this road, the first thing you see is Lot 1. So that's where most people pull into. Lot 6 kind of acts like an overflow lot for Lot 1. So what we actually saw was Lot 1, in the beginning, saw a decrease in activity. It kind of filled back up over time as people were finding parking spots. Lot 6, though, as the overflow lot for Lot 1, actually saw a decrease in its occupancy while this area over here saw an increase.

Mr. Locke: Okay. Thank you. Is this the same type of mapping you wanted to do . . . I'm questioning Mary Ellen, I'm sorry . . . what you wanted to do for residential, for development? I think you had made a proposal like a month ago or something.

Ms. Gray: Yes, we're working with Jay and his folks on that.

Mr. Locke: It's a great program. Thanks.

Mr. McIntosh: Anybody else? Alan?

Mr. Silverman: I have a number of questions, and since we're going to be talking about economics today, I want to approach the presentation from that point of view. This is phenomenal work and it should be seen by a lot of people. I think it speaks highly of the IT effort that I know sometimes takes a bashing with respect to what do they do for the City of Newark? This is what they do for the City of Newark.

From the economic point of view, you're using Bing mapping as one of your underlay maps?

Mr. Mulvanity: I believe before we were actually using Google, if I remember correctly.

Mr. Silverman: I would suggest we go back to Google because it's been my experience that Google shows references to businesses, to churches, to locations. It does an excellent job of identifying landmarks and even businesses by name. So somebody who is looking at this and they want to know where the Deer Park is, or Klondike Kate's, or the Methodist Church on Main Street, Google will tell them and give an exact street address, so that might be a valuable linkage.

Mr. Mulvanity: Here is a different base map. There are a number of base maps on here that you can choose.

Mr. Silverman: Okay.

Mr. Mulvanity: I didn't get to show all of them. There's a lot of different ones, but you can see here it has all the University buildings . . . most of the University buildings on it. And when you go to Main Street, let me see if we have anything that pops up here for us. It doesn't look like we're getting private businesses here . . .

Mr. Silverman: But the Google system that I'm familiar with, the public one that I can access, it does have place name and landmark references, which I think would be valuable for the economic side, plus show people where the parking lots and parking is in relationship to their destination. I like the idea of including the University lots, at least at this time, just showing where they are. So if the University has lots open for parents during a particular special event, there can be that kind of communication and it can be found when the parent says, gee, I'm coming to Newark, where do I park? So I think that's a valuable link.

You mentioned your red and green lots, the private monthly lots. Has there been any thought with respect to the private lots, to opening up some of those spaces for hourly rates? And I say that because if we're looking at decoupling. Or a merchant may be involved in a contractual

arrangement right now with the City where maybe they want to try having half of their parking spaces available to hourly patrons for a drop-in kind of business. And on the flip side, are monthly parking permits issued for the hourly City controlled lots to kind of even that out? Or are the City controlled lots primarily hourly rather than monthly?

Mr. Mulvanity: Well we have floated the idea, for instance, for Lot 2 here . . . this is a very busy monthly parking lot. In fact, I would say it's our most coveted monthly parking lot here with its proximity to the University and a lot of the businesses, versus Lot 5, which is closer to the east side of East Main Street. We have floated the idea of putting parking meters in here at points due to the fact that it's not very busy at night . . .

Mr. Silverman: That's where I was headed. For a multiple patron use. There's the daytime stationary and there may be the nighttime and weekend casual.

Mr. Mulvanity: Right. We floated that idea of putting in parking meters and, of course, that is a cost to us. We would have to install parking meters. We would have to buy more parking meters for it. We've also floated the idea of just doing a night pass in Lot 2, and allowing the employees that park, for instance a business like Grotto's that has a nightlife, for those employees to be able to purchase a nighttime pass only, where they could use that at night and that would draw them, hopefully, out of Lot 3 and Lot 1, and put them into a more centralized location. Again, to free up parking for our customers that are coming in to utilize the businesses.

Mr. Silverman: Okay, and based on your last comments, I'm just going to check off my last question about are you working on the employee long-term/short-term/odd hour parking, and apparently you are. Thank you.

Mr. Mulvanity: Right.

Mr. Lee Mikles: Who is the target audience for this?

Mr. Mulvanity: I'm sorry, can you repeat your question?

Mr. Mikles: Who is the target audience? Is it the consumer or is it the . . .

Mr. Mulvanity: It would be the patron. Somebody that's either been to Newark and wants to know where the parking is, or somebody that's never been to Newark before. That being said, the more utility we add to it, I think you expand that audience.

Mr. Mikles: Okay.

Mr. Mulvanity: Even somebody like me, I'm down here every day. I would use this map if it had, for instance, occupancy numbers for parking lots and parking meters. The tool becomes more valuable with more utility. So originally it would be anybody coming downtown who might not know the area, who might be looking for a place to park, where do I park? But ultimately, I think that audience could be greatly expanded with some utility.

Mr. Mikles: Have you looked at the mobile version of this or how it appears on a cell phone?

Mr. Jay Hodny: It looks good.

Mr. Mikles: It does?

Mr. Hodny: Yeah, I mean the way these things are configured in the Arc GIS environment . . .

Ms. Gray: Jay, can you use a mike?

Mr. Hodny: Sorry, the way that these maps are configured in the GIS environment, they're designed in the background to work on tablets, smart phones, and laptops, whatever. You might have to train yourself with a little bit of different navigation depending on the device, but it works great.

Mr. Mikles: Because what was really useful . . . this is great stuff . . . but what was really useful was the pop-ups with the information and I just wanted to make sure like . . . I think this would be fantastic for a user coming to town. I think we've got an opportunity to change the perception if we were able to lead in with this. One, is how to use it. So an intro when it pops up, how to use this, what this stuff means, and you had the keys there. But you need to balance this one checkbox up in the left corner and get different things. But also starting out with, you know, there's over 1,500 spots in Newark. Like just sort of changing those perceptions with stating that information right up front. There's 1,500 spots, there's this and this.

The other thing I was going to ask you is if we could have different starting views into this. Because a resident has a totally different interest . . . if I saw lots in there and I'm not going to look at all the color schemes because I'm just a first-time user, and I see all these residential opportunities that aren't really of use to me for my trip to go downtown, but a resident is going to have a totally different perception. Could we have a resident intro into this versus a first-time versus a consumer or guest that would have different sort of presets set?

Mr. Hodny: The way the map appears is based on how I set the map extent. So you can just set one map extent. So what I can do is back it out and then reset it so you get a little bit larger picture. And then whoever wants to drill downtown, they can.

Mr. Mikles: But you couldn't have one link in that has all the residential automatically set, turned on, and one with all the residential automatically, by default, turned off? No?

Mr. Hodny: I can create multiple parking map applications . . .

Mr. Mikles: Okay.

Mr. Hodny: Which, you know, you could have one for this and you could have one for residential, but now you're talking about three or four different map applications . . .

Mr. Mikles: To maintain.

Mr. Hodny: To support.

Mr. Mikles: Okay.

Mr. Hodny: What was . . . you had a comment before that. I was going to answer it.

Mr. Mikles: Was it about usability or loading information right when you jumped in? I just think, as a user, it's great stuff. As a first-time user, it might be a little daunting.

Mr. Hodny: Yeah, I mean this . . . I can, probably after this afternoon, I will put it on the City's website and take down the old one. And so anybody that accesses the City's website, can go to the City Maps link near the bottom and bring this map up. So it's available to anybody.

Mr. Mikles: I'm just looking at it as a marketing tool for Newark.

Mr. Hodny: Now I remember what it was.

Mr. Mikles: Okay.

Mr. Hodny: I'm not sure why it's not showing here, but when you first open the app, there's a splash screen that comes up, and that gives you general information.

Mr. Mikles: Okay.

Mr. Hodny: Like right now there's holiday parking on there. There's the do's and don't's in the parking lots. That is very easy to update and add to with whatever we want to do.

Mr. Mikles: Okay, great. Thank you.

Mr. McIntosh: Rob?

Mr. Cappiello: Yeah, so I was more curious about the mobile ability and how you push this out. Is it something you're thinking to link that the University can push out at the time of high peak traffic to say, you know, go to Newark's website to look for parking opportunities? Something that would kind of overlap the two. Say, our lots are here and here. If you're coming in for Parents' Weekend, this is a great useful tool as you come into Newark. Or you're taking your kids out for dinner. Here's a great way to go find a place that you can go and get to. So what would the mobile . . . how would that look and how would you push that out to both residential users and the University users that are coming in for those peak events?

Mr. Hodny: I'm not exactly sure. I think we'd have to have a conversation with the University parking group and see how to share resources back and forth. There's probably a way to do that but, off-hand, I don't know. Right now we're just focused on the City parking. We're putting the University garages on there, I guess, as a courtesy. We're willing to add additional lots and get more information. There's probably a way to meld and bring the two together so one can point to the other, but we'll see.

Mr. Rich Rind: I had a question just related to Alan's point earlier about the off-time usage of the permit lots. Do we have usage data? Are we doing occupancy counts on those lots at nights and weekends when they're not full?

Mr. Mulvanity: So we currently don't have countdown signs in monthly parking lots. We just installed them in Lot 1. That being said, we do have the bird's eye view with cameras to see that these lots are not near at occupancy at nighttime. They are majorly used between 9:00 am and 5:00 p.m. So after 5:00 p.m., by 5:30 you start to get the rush of people, you know, just like rush hour traffic, leaving the parking lot. So we know that this particular lot, Lot 2 that's up on the screen right now, is not full at night. Lot 5 is a little different. Lot 5 is actually, we rent spaces, and it's almost like you're paying rent on a parking space. You get a personal parking space. So it's the opposite. During the daytime there's less people in Lot 5. At night, there are a lot of people. Overnight there are a lot of people in the parking spaces, but that is their own personal parking space. They get a numbered parking space. Lot 2 is different. You can park anywhere in Lot 2 if you have a pass to be in Lot 2. And that's where you have employees going there during the day to park. As far as exact occupancy numbers, we do not have a system in place to do that, but just the eye test alone, I think, is good in this case because it's clear that, you know, if I were to pull into Lot 2 right now, there's probably only a few spots in there open. At night you would have no problem getting in there.

Mr. Rind: Yeah, one of the reasons why I ask is that my daughter lives in that building right there and so I use the lot a lot but I don't leave my car there for any extended period of time. But it's filled with students and they have friends that are visiting from out of town, what have you, so there's a lot of opportunity to take their money if you would let them park there, instead of slapping a ticket on their windshield, which is not necessarily a voluntary transaction, right?

Mr. Mulvanity: I don't believe that new building came with parking, so what that would be, I don't know where those students . . . a lot of those students that are living in that building, a lot

of them actually park in Lot 5 down on the east end of East Main Street. But for that parking lot, that lot stays “occupied” by the . . . just because there’s a max number of people you can put in the parking lot at any given time. Because it has 70 spaces in that parking lot, we only oversell it a percentage so much because not everybody is going to be in the parking lot at one time. But that time of day when there aren’t people in that parking lot would be after 5:00 or 6:00 at night.

Mr. Rind: Yeah, there’s definitely an opportunity to make some money there, if nothing else. I know the students that live there are very creative about where they put their cars, including my own daughter, who put it so far away that she doesn’t use it anymore because she doesn’t want to walk to it. Which is even better. But there is definitely a revenue opportunity there, at the very least.

Mr. Mulvanity: We will continue to look at options for that parking lot.

Mr. Rind: Thank you.

Mr. Locke: Mr. Chair, I have a couple of questions. Can you take the pointer and go to one of the meters on East Main Street?

Mr. Mulvanity: Yes.

Mr. Locke: And I think it shows availability, timing . . . so parking is free from what? Is it 1:00 a.m.?

Mr. Mulvanity: Yes. So this is going to sound a little difficult here. I’m going to try to work through it. So there is no parking on these parking meters from 2:00 a.m. to 6:00 a.m. After 6:00 a.m. until 8:00 a.m., it is basically free.

Mr. Locke: Okay.

Mr. Mulvanity: You do not have to pay to park there. There is pre-payment available, though. So if I came in at 7:30 a.m., I can pre-pay the parking meter through whatever time I need it, up to two hours.

Mr. Locke: Okay.

Mr. Mulvanity: Then from 8:00 a.m. to 1:00 a.m., it’s under normal operation.

Mr. Locke: Okay.

Mr. Mulvanity: From 1:00 a.m. to 2:00 a.m., it goes back to a no-charge status.

Mr. Locke: Gotcha. Okay, so roughly each meter, I may be off a little bit with my math, can generate about \$22.50 a day. Do you have any data on how many of these meters are generating at least 80% of the total \$22.50, or \$18.00 a day?

Mr. Mulvanity: I can get those numbers. I don’t have them on me. That being said, with turnover on meters, it can go even higher than that number.

Mr. Locke: Even better.

Mr. Mulvanity: So I would imagine with occupancy being so high through 11:00 a.m. until say 5:00 p.m. that it gets very close to at least 80% on a lot of these two-hour parking meters in the central business district.

Mr. Locke: Right, and the reason why I’m asking that, I know there’s going to be a discussion about increasing the meter rates. That data would be huge to show, one, that what Council

passed a few years ago that the minute you pull out, the meter ends, so that helps your argument. Second, if you can show that you're running at 80% occupancy on most of these meters, then the market justifies an increase in rate. Once you get to that 70-80% rate, you increase your rates. And I think that would be useful information.

Now going back to 52 East Main, kind of piggybacking on some of the comments that Rich and Alan said, I was shocked to hear that there are monthlies there. And I'm shocked for a couple of reasons. One, the location is ideal for meter and I think you'd generate a lot more money. Second, those people that own those apartments in those locations have an unbelievable advantage against their competition by having their students being able to buy monthly parking meters. Do those monthly permits have any time restriction, or are they good any time during the month?

Mr. Mulvanity: I just want to start off by saying actually in this particular parking lot, it is mostly businesses that have permits in them.

Mr. Locke: How do you know that?

Mr. Mulvanity: Well this one major building right here did not get any parking with the parking lot.

Mr. Locke: No, I know. When Angela did that building at 52, she gave 24 spots, which is what you have right . . . her property ends right about, I think, here. So how do you know that it's just businesses, because there are probably 100 students living in that building and I'd be shocked if they weren't lined up at your door trying to get those monthlies?

Mr. Mulvanity: They are lined up but because it is mostly businesses that are in there, or someone that has a lease with us, they don't get them. We refer them to Lot 5. We very rarely, if ever, have open spots in Lot 2, and that's just because we are trying to move all business owners . . . a couple of years ago we went through the process of moving business owners and employees that had monthlies in our hourly parking lots into this parking lot, trying to consolidate our monthly permit holders. So this lot, unless a business goes out of business, is generally for a manager/employee/owner.

Mr. Locke: So if I own Caffé Gelato and I want to get two spots for my managers, I can buy two spots there?

Mr. Mulvanity: Well right now we're at capacity, but if we had openings, then yes. That's where we would put them.

Mr. Locke: Okay.

Mr. Mulvanity: We would not try to put a new monthly in Lot 1 or Lot 3 or 4.

Mr. Locke: Okay. I think it would be useful to know how many are being bought by businesses because that definitely addresses the issue about employee parking. That this is definitely an alternative, because this is a great spot for employees to park when they're there. Okay.

And just the digital count you've installed on Lot 1 – fantastic. I drive by three or four times a day and at night, and it's amazing seeing the count numbers. You know, at lunch there's almost nothing and at dinner time there's almost nothing, but then 11:00 p.m. and midnight, there's plenty. So it's interesting to finally see that data.

And then my last comment was what Lee had said that there's 1,600 parking spaces, but when you really look at it, 1,120 are controlled by two lots – Newark Shopping Center, which aggressively tows, and then Trabant, which is at the furthest end of Main Street. So the old adage, location, location, location. This is why we have a parking issue, because 75-80% of the

parking spaces available in the total are at both ends of Main Street, and one who is not very friendly to having non-customers parking there, and the other one, very friendly, Trabant, but the location isn't the greatest. So . . .

Mr. McIntosh: Thank you. I've got a couple of questions, myself. There was some, I think it was Lee who had something about events, or maybe it was Rob. It was Rob, talking about events and advertising them, which I like that idea a lot. Then there was some discussion about the University and this is really focused on the City. If the University is having a big event, it's a big event for the City.

Mr. Cappiello: It is. If you work in downtown Newark . . .

Ms. Gray: Can you use a microphone?

Mr. McIntosh: Thou shalt not speak without a microphone.

Mr. Cappiello: So if you regularly come and work in downtown Newark, you know when Parents' Weekend is. You know when graduation is. You know when all these large events happen because it impacts everyone. So to be able to effectively, either on their part or the City's part, to put out that information to help alleviate that stress and direct people to where you want them to go in a mobile app or whatever, and just as a footnote to the slew of parent emails that you get as you have kids in the University, you know, if you're coming into Newark, these are places you can stay for a hotel, here are places where you can park if you're coming in for downtown dining. I think that's a great additional thing to put out.

Mr. McIntosh: So staying on that, it seems to me that there's be some advantage to the City and to the University to work on this together from an IT standpoint and maybe, because I really do like the idea of residential and event parking and so on, so there may be a way around that that isn't so cumbersome for the City to do if it had a partner in the University. And I'm not speaking for the University here, I'm just throwing out something that might make a little bit of sense is the two of you work together. They've got a lot more IT than you folks have in the City, and maybe you can figure that out. But the end user is the customer here. The people that have the automobiles that are coming to the town, or not coming to the town because they don't think they can park their car anywhere. So to the extent that we can make that more user friendly for the end user, then we're ahead of the game. So if they can on that opening page say I'm a resident and you get . . . or I'm going to see a resident . . . I don't know what you'd say there, but that would be what the map would focus on because it would call it up by clicking on it. Or if I'm coming down to eat, I'm just a visitor to downtown, then that would be something else again. I'm coming in here for an event and that would be yet another thing, kind of. I don't know necessarily which kinds of things that you would put together, but to the extent that we could make it user friendly for the end user, whoever it is, whether University related or City restaurant related, whatever it may be, that would be very helpful. And also the concept of everybody, when they're having an event, if you're having something going on at the church, you know, goes to the map. That's a . . . so we drive as much activity to the map as possible. And we can market that. The last time we were talking about public relations, right?

Mr. Cappiello: And that's certainly something, as we go forward, if this is as useful a tool as it seems to be, we just put a link on the emails and invites that we're sending to the people that are coming to our events to say we know the church has limited parking. We appreciate you coming to these events. Here is a convenient link to where you can find additional parking in downtown Newark. So you're not driving around in circles. You're not getting that feel of frustration. We work really well with the parking authority for Lot 1 when we have, unfortunately, funerals and things of that sort. We had one not too long ago and we tried to direct the family away from a peak time and there was no getting around it. It is what it was. And we did have someone drop a parent off and then come, you know, jogging through the church trying to get there because he was, I guess, participating in the service. He couldn't get

a parking spot. And I don't know where he ended up parking. I ended up helping the mother upstairs and she said my son is coming right behind me, and it was probably about eight minutes later he was jogging down the hallway. So it would have been helpful.

Mr. McIntosh: And the other thing of bird's eye view . . . I heard that used. So that struck me as meaning something that is in the moment. You've got a camera that's shooting down into a lot and you can tell at any given point in time what's used and what's not used. Am I correct in assuming that?

Mr. Mulvanity: Yes, we do have cameras through our Lot 1, Lot 3, and Lot 4 hourly parking lots. So we can see what our occupancy is. A bird's eye view.

Mr. McIntosh: Okay. So all I'm saying is that's something that could be very useful if we could make it available for our end users coming in. You know at any moment in time what's available. And where it's available. Because you've got a camera showing you where it is. I'm making it sound simplistic and I know it's not. Or I think it's not. But those are the kinds of thoughts I hope you're looking at, because we've got an incredibly good, robust technology here that we should use as completely as possible.

And lastly, of the employers that have bought monthly parking, is it always for their employees and ownership?

Mr. Mulvanity: It's sometimes for owners. It's sometimes for the managers of the business. And then sometimes it's for the employees. There is generally a limit because it is parking that is limited. So we don't want to give ten permits to business A, and then business B opens and now there's no parking in the lot. So there is a limit. Generally, that limit is around two or three.

Mr. McIntosh: Okay.

Mr. Mulvanity: So a lot of time it is managers that will have that, per business.

Mr. McIntosh: So, because we have Lee here, if he had two or three of these spaces . . . which you probably don't, because you don't need them . . . but if you did, how many employees do you have?

Mr. Mikles: A lot more than that.

Mr. McIntosh: A lot more.

Mr. Mikles: It would be pretty difficult to ration them.

Mr. McIntosh: Yeah, it seems that way to me anytime I go in there, which is very frequent, by the way. So this isn't really solving any employee parking issues. It may be resolving it for a few key employees, but it is not the general person working in these businesses who is getting the advantage of that. Am I correct in saying that?

Mr. Mulvanity: Right. That parking lot there only has 70 parking spaces in it, so there's probably more than 70 employees right there on that block alone.

Mr. McIntosh: Okay.

Mr. Mulvanity: So that's why it is limited by business. And then we have to leave a little bit of wiggle room in there for new businesses that open up on Main Street. Anywhere close to that parking lot, the first thing they do when they open up . . . even before they open up . . . is to come to our parking office and say, okay, what parking do you have for me?

Mr. McIntosh: Well that makes sense to me. I'm not being critical. I just need to understand it better. Well we're running out of time on this ten minute discussion. I think we're at nine minutes, 30 seconds in some other universe. But I really want . . . yes, Rob?

Mr. Cappiello: Just a thought. When you're talking about employee parking, any businesses that especially deal with public on a regular business, any employer where I ever worked, we always drove employees to the outer reaches, the further away. You made it most convenient for your paying customers. So that lot right there, looks like a really convenient lot. And if I'm going to give some prime parking to my employees, wouldn't you rather give it to the customer? So drive them down to Lot 5 and say, yes, there's parking available for you, but you're going to have to walk, or pay, as an employee. You know, it is what it is. When I was a teenager and you worked at the mall, they said that row out there by I-95, that's where you guys park and you walk in, because we want grandma and grandpa and everyone whose coming in with their gold Amex and platinum cards, we want them in the front row, right here.

Mr. Locke: And just to piggyback on that, you're 100% right. Lot 1 is right across the street and it's running at tremendous occupancy. And that lot is right across from there. That is a great lot to really capitalize on it. I agree. That is your prime parking lot and it needs to be used for the City's advantage.

Mr. McIntosh: Okay, and there may be solutions for that coming from our group discussions, which is where we're heading right now. So thank you, gentlemen, for your time. You're doing a great job. This is a tremendous service and keep it up. Make it more robust every moment of every day. Okay?

Mr. Mulvanity: Alright. Thank you.

Mr. McIntosh: And report back to Rob.

Mr. Cappiello: Conveniently enough, he's next door.

Mr. McIntosh: Yes. You go down, say a prayer and then whatever.

4. SMALL GROUP DISCUSSION – IDENTIFIED ISSUES

Mr. McIntosh: Okay, we're ready to break into groups. So let's have the stormwater . . . where do you want to be, Will?

Mr. Hurd: Over there is fine.

Mr. McIntosh: Over by Courtney?

Mr. Hurd: Sure.

Mr. McIntosh: Is that good? Is that where you were pointing?

Mr. Hurd: Yes.

Mr. McIntosh: Alright, so stormwater . . . and all I know is that Chris Locke will be with you. Would anybody else like to be in the stormwater group? It's really exciting. Yes, I mean, I would pick stormwater. When I think about it . . . never mind. Jim, are you a stormwater kind of guy?

Mr. Jim Jones: I did my homework on the financials but . . .

Mr. McIntosh: Okay, well, no, if you did . . .

Mr. Jones: I know about stormwater too, if you want me to work on stormwater.

Mr. McIntosh: Anyway, well you take . . . this is not an option.

Mr. Locke: Mike should do stormwater.

Mr. Rind: Yeah, he's the Planning guy.

Mr. McIntosh: Yeah, stormwater. You three go down and start talking about water.

And the economics of parking, we have Alan and Jim. Who else wants to do that? I'm being permissive right now. Alright.

Dr. John Morgan: I can join that one.

Mr. McIntosh: Which one? Economics?

Dr. Morgan: The economics of parking.

Mr. McIntosh: Ms. White, where would you like to be?

Ms. Jean White: Private lots.

Mr. McIntosh: Private lots. You can certainly be there. Private lots, I would like you there anyway, and Lee I think you'd be good at it, myself and Jean. Why don't we let the economics people stay here and we'll move over on that table over there.

Ms. Gray: Frank, where would you like me?

Mr. McIntosh: Wherever you think you'd add the most value.

Ms. Gray: Okay, good.

Mr. McIntosh: Okay, folks, it's 3:00 p.m. and what I'd like to do is have 30 minutes of this discussion. Alright? Thirty minutes. You're on the clock.

Breakout Groups:

- Group 1 – Stormwater Issues: Will Hurd, Chris Locke, Mike Fortner
- Group 2 – Economics of Parking: Alan Silverman, Rob Cappiello, Mary Ellen Gray, Jim Jones, John Morgan
- Group 3 – Private/Independent Lots and Employee Parking: Frank McIntosh, Lee Mikles, Rich Rind, Jean White, Matt Zapp

[Secretary's Note: Members of the Parking Subcommittee and audience assembled in different corners of the room for breakout sessions at 3:09 p.m.]

BREAKOUT GROUP 1 – STORMWATER ISSUES (HURD, LOCKE, FORTNER)

Mr. Locke: Are we recording?

Mr. Fortner: It's on.

Mr. Locke: So unfortunately, I have to leave in ten minutes because my son's playing in a basketball game at McKean High School.

Mr. Hurd: Oh, okay.

Mr. Fortner: So let's get this done.

Mr. Locke: So really the issue is the requirement of Council is making us do these parking lots, you know, is just making the stormwater problem worse.

Mr. Fortner: Yeah.

Mr. Locke: Because, you know, instead of making some nice grass fields or walkways or pathways, or whatever, I've got parking lots. So that was what I was raising was that . . .

Mr. Hurd: But it's interesting because this gets . . . I mean, we've had previous conversations when it's like let's talk about current energy efficiency. Well, does the City want to encourage energy efficiency when they sell electricity? It's kind of this conflicting thing.

Mr. Locke: It is.

Mr. Hurd: If I'm receiving a fee for stormwater [inaudible] based on impervious surface, how does it work if I'm also encouraging you to not make a bunch of impervious surface?

Mr. Locke: Exactly right.

Mr. Hurd: I think in some ways you want the City to do actually do that so it doesn't look like they're trying to make you pay for things that they make you have.

Mr. Locke: Exactly right.

Mr. Hurd: It's like, you need all this parking and, oh, by the way, it costs this much to have it.

Mr. Locke: And to take it one step further, not only is that an issue, but the City is in the parking business.

Mr. Hurd: Right.

Mr. Locke: So if they want to make more money on their parking, they shouldn't have so much private parking. They should be forcing drivers to go into their parking . . .

Mr. Fortner: No, they can [inaudible] create parking and pay the fee, which I think there are higher standards on that in terms of we also want quality of life and having big parking lots doesn't help with quality of life.

Mr. Locke: Right. I agree.

Mr. Fortner: To say that's incentive to collect fees on stormwater . . .

Mr. Hurd: Right.

Mr. Fortner: Or how we can make more on parking, or whatever. Anyway, so yeah . . .

Mr. Locke: It is a valid point.

Mr. Fortner: It's a valid point, yeah.

Mr. Hurd: I'm sure you see the most efficient way to have all that parking without increasing your impervious surface is a garage.

Mr. Locke: That's exactly right. Absolutely.

Mr. Fortner: Well, and density.

Mr. Locke: And density.

Mr. Hurd: Well, it compacts its, yeah. If you say where can you make one big lot as opposed to three small lots?

Mr. Locke: Right. And that big lot or big garage can take so much. I mean, you know, if you've got 600 garage parking spaces, that's a lot of development that you can do.

Mr. Hurd: Okay so that ties in, kind of, to the parking standards that we discussed last time.

Mr. Locke: Exactly.

Mr. Hurd: At least our initial assumption that we would like to encourage, basically, no parking requirements within the downtown for private development so that it gets pushed to the City, which then . . .

Mr. Locke: And it also puts less stress on the stormwater management for the City, which saves the City money.

Mr. Fortner: As you pointed out, a lot of that is getting to the economics, but that's more commercial space allowed, more taxes, more apartments . . .

Mr. Hurd: Right.

Mr. Locke: Exactly.

Mr. Hurd: Well, and more ability to have mixed use buildings that really could be retail/office/apartment, instead of going, I don't have space to put parking for the retail, and I'm certainly not putting in offices, which is another ten spaces.

Mr. Locke: Exactly right.

Mr. Hurd: Because every time I see projects, I'm like where's that third thing? We've got retail, we've got residential, but we don't have office.

Mr. Locke: Yeah.

Mr. Hurd: Where do you work?

Mr. Locke: That's exactly right. And the economics of office space is you don't get as much of a rental rate on an office versus retail or residential. And then you're less incentivized because the parking requirement is greater.

Mr. Hurd: Right.

Mr. Locke: So building an office building in downtown Newark makes absolutely no sense right now.

Mr. Hurd: Well you always think of it as like the second floor. But, again, the parking requirements are going to hold you up.

Mr. Fortner: You're more likely to need to drive in, right? Yeah.

Mr. Locke: Yeah.

Mr. Hurd: Yeah.

Mr. Fortner: As opposed to customers.

Mr. Hurd: Because you can manage for it. You can manage the customers and you can manage the students . . . the residents, I should say. I say students but the residents. But the office workers are more likely . . .

Mr. Locke: Thank you for saying residents. It's really, you know, when I hear conversations both at Planning and the City, we need to stop saying student apartments. It's discriminatory. It's a violation of federal law. There is no such thing as student apartments. They're just apartments. I cannot . . .

Mr. Fortner: Yeah, but you're only targeting the students.

Mr. Locke: We don't. We don't. We put our apartments . . . and we have non-students living in our apartments. But when we say it, you're really violating a federal law.

Mr. Hurd: Yeah.

Mr. Locke: You don't want to do that. So when Council is saying we're approving another student apartment, well I hope you're not, because that's a violation of Fair Housing Act.

Mr. Fortner: Well, it's not.

Mr. Locke: It is.

Mr. Fortner: They're not a protected class.

Mr. Locke: No, what I'm saying is you cannot say student apartments because you're giving the perception to the public that these apartments are only available to the students, and that's a violation of the Fair Housing Act. When you advertise, when you talk about a complex, you can't do that.

Mr. Hurd: I mean it's certainly, you know, by location and such, they're ideal for the student . . .

Mr. Locke: Absolutely.

Mr. Hurd: Which is a whole different thing.

Mr. Locke: That's a whole different thing. That's right.

Mr. Hurd: Alright.

Mr. Locke: But we digressed.

Mr. Hurd: We digressed, yes. Now we're back to where we started.

Mr. Locke: That's right. So that was really the issue that stormwater is. If you minimize parking, you minimize the effect of stormwater, you minimize the effect it has on stormwater infrastructure, which then minimizes expenses.

Mr. Fortner: But if you build dense though, too, isn't that the same, more or less?

Mr. Hurd: No.

Mr. Locke: No, because you don't have the oil.

Mr. Fortner: The oils, well that's true.

Mr. Locke: You don't have the cars and the gas and all that. You don't have any of that.

Mr. Fortner: So it's easier to do stormwater . . . if you had a lot, this is your lot and it's all building, then that's easier to do stormwater management on then if you have the building here and this is all parking lot.

Mr. Hurd: Well, yeah, it's easier because all of your stormwater is basically roof, which is controlled run-off.

Mr. Fortner: Okay.

Mr. Hurd: You can pipe it, drop it in cisterns, boom, you know where it's going. Parking lots, you know, if you don't have it curved or swaled or things, it's like well, I hope it goes to the drains. But maybe it's not going to the drains. Maybe some of it's overlapping. You know, if the drains get clogged and then the oils . . .

Mr. Locke: And then you have to salt and sand and all that from storms . . .

Mr. Fortner: Yeah.

Mr. Locke: And that really is the thing that effects your stormwater quality. So that's why . . . and yeah, I mean, you can build a building, but make them put a green roof on. It's a great way . . .

Mr. Hurd: Yeah. Absolutely.

Mr. Locke: To improve the quality of stormwater. We did it at 132 [East Main Street] and we would do it in other buildings if we didn't lose the economics of putting all these freaking parking spaces everywhere, because it would make sense.

Mr. Hurd: You have a green roof on 132?

Mr. Locke: 132, yeah.

Mr. Fortner: You did it at One South Main, too, didn't you?

Mr. Locke: No.

Mr. Fortner: Oh, you didn't do it?

Mr. Locke: We wanted to but we did the pervious around the building that was able to address that issue.

Mr. Fortner: Oh.

Mr. Hurd: And if it's done right, it helps cut down on your heat in the building.

Mr. Locke: Absolutely right. And it just makes the building look nicer. You know, it just makes the building look nicer. And tenants like it. Tenants think it's a cool thing. You've got a green roof.

Mr. Hurd: Especially if you've got multiple heights, that's always nice, too. You can look down on it.

Mr. Locke: So, yeah, for the people who live at Washington House, it's a great thing, because they're not looking just at a roof at 132. They're looking at some green space. Well, we nailed this one.

Mr. Fortner: We knocked it out.

Mr. Hurd: We're in favor of reducing parking . . . reducing required parking on private buildings because of stormwater management issues.

Mr. Locke: Okay. I'm off to see my son's basketball game.

Mr. Fortner: Alright, have a good one.

Mr. Hurd: Alright.

Mr. Locke: When Michelle sent the date, I said I've got our Christmas luncheon before this and I have a basketball game at 3:30. I said you've got me for that period of time and I promise not to drink at the Christmas luncheon.

Mr. Hurd: Oh, I'm sorry.

Mr. Locke: Merry Christmas and happy holidays.

Mr. Fortner: Merry Christmas.

BREAKOUT GROUP 2 – ECONOMICS OF PARKING (SILVERMAN, CAPPIELLO, GRAY, JONES, MORGAN)

Mr. Silverman: With respect to economic use, I'd like to take it from the point of view of land use. Until we really got into the Comprehensive Development Plan and the issue of parking, I never really gave parking any thought as a particular use that had an impact on the community, like locating a commercial or office or industrial site. It's usually considered an afterthought. It's an auxiliary or ancillary use to a primary use, and we still look at that today. Also, as Mary Ellen has pointed out a number of times, the parking standards that are used in Newark are simply drafted from suburban standards. And it turns out that those standards were driven by the industry – the automobile industry, the commercial retail industry – that would like to have as many parking spaces available as their biggest peak days a couple of times a year, and we'll throw in the asphalt and paint people, and all the rest of the people. So parking I consider a land use. And in Newark, if you look at the illustration, probably just in our CBD, a bird's eye guesstimate, there's probably 30-40% of the undeveloped space in Newark is devoted to parking. And it's not open space. There's no visual component. There's no natural component. It's just there. Unfortunately, and this is where Rob comes in, we have no way of bringing to the attention of Council the real economic impact of that particular land use. We can't measure what the return on investment is with respect to the primary use. We know that the costs involved in that land use have to be passed on to whoever is renting the square footage or renting the area. So we know that there's a cost involved. We know from an assessment point of view that that particular land use is not taxed the way other land uses are. It's rolled into the lot. So from a tax point of view, from an assessment point of view, it apparently has no value other than what may be secondarily derived from the value of the building. But with our property tax system, it isn't based on dollar value or income, it's based on bricks and mortar and square feet, and then averaged. So there's lost economic opportunity there.

Mr. Cappiello: So with that, you're saying the shopping center at the beginning of Main Street basically is driving no revenue for the square footage of all that parking that's in there?

Mr. Silverman: That's correct.

Mr. Jones: Relatively little.

Mr. Silverman: Relatively little.

Mr. Jones: It's more than farmland but it's less than building.

Mr. Silverman: And it's nothing that directly benefits the City of Newark, for example, with the sales tax.

Mr. Jones: Right.

Mr. Silverman: If the City of Newark derived a sales tax off the sales generated per square foot in that shopping center, then you could maybe argue that there's a link.

Mr. Cappiello: Because people are parking there and then spending money.

Mr. Silverman: They're going to spend money there and that 160 square feet, or whatever it is, has a certain value per square foot. But the City derives no revenue from it. And as the run-off group is going to be talking about, there is actually a cost to that.

Mr. Jones: There is a cost.

Mr. Cappiello: Because now you have to maintain whatever is coming off of that.

Mr. Silverman: Stormwater management and stormwater quality management.

Mr. Jones: Right.

Mr. Silverman: Which can get to be expensive.

Mr. Cappiello: Because no longer can we live with just . . .

Mr. Jones: You can't just pour it in the White Clay Creek and let it go somewhere else.

Mr. Silverman: Parking lots consuming additional land to accommodate the structures that deal with the run-off.

We get complaints about traffic, stop-and-go, and you can't get any place, but another thing that this particular land use creates is an interruption of normal traffic flow. Every time . . . it's called a curb cut in technical terms . . . every time there's a driveway, there's a cut in the curb to allow an automobile to either enter or leave the public right-of-way. It causes a motorist to have to make a change in their driving habits.

Mr. Cappiello: It interrupts the pattern.

Mr. Silverman: It interrupts the flow. So there is a cost to that, or an impact to that particular kind of land use. Additional traffic signals are needed, and Dr. Morgan has talked about the potential concentration of traffic by virtue of parking buildings and such. Traffic lights, I argue, cause that same kind of thing because they have to be there to accommodate cross traffic. Or, as we find with the University, which is unique, pedestrian traffic. There are these constant interruptions which are a burden on the transportation system.

There is a direct overhead cost that the literature has shown that somebody has to pay for that parking, through mortgages, the money to put it in, and the money to maintain it. And those costs are not absorbed by the developer. They're passed on in square footage and in rent. Some of the literature in urban areas claims as much as \$200 a month in apartment rent is tied up in paying for that parking space that you may or may not use.

Mr. Cappiello: Just in long-term investment for future repairs, maintenance and then snow removal and . . .

Mr. Silverman: And lighting.

Mr. Cappiello: Okay.

Mr. Silverman: And everything.

Mr. Cappiello: Re-stripping and all that stuff.

Mr. Silverman: Yes. Plus, again, it's an area that's not taxed and, as I've commented from time to time, by virtue of having parking under the building, the mass of the building is impacted. There's an extra 14 feet of height that has to be there because it has to accommodate parking underneath it. So it affects the skyline. Although it doesn't come up in our discussion here, the police probably have stats on this, those parking lots . . . and I wish we had our picture up here . . .

Ms. Gray: What picture do you want?

Mr. Silverman: The one with the private parking behind buildings.

Ms. Gray: This one?

Dr. Morgan: Well to some extent it's on your handout.

Mr. Silverman: Oh, okay. Good point. Some of these private parking lots that are behind the buildings that appear grayed out are places where people will congregate for not necessarily good purposes.

Mr. Jones: Can I take a stab at summarizing what you're doing here, which is suggesting that parking has cost of benefits. The cost, at least from the City's point of view, are higher than the benefits . . .

Mr. Silverman: Yes.

Mr. Jones: And so having it decentralized like this makes it worse than if it was centralized, compacted into a smaller area, i.e., maybe a smaller, taller area. If it was a garage, it would be a more efficient way to operate parking within the City given the costs that parking imposes on the City.

Mr. Silverman: A garage potentially [inaudible] some of the things that were discussed in taking the monthly lots and making them a mixed lot.

Mr. Jones: Right. Okay.

Mr. Silverman: The multiple permits until 5:00 p.m. and after 5:00 p.m. . . .

Mr. Jones: So a better way to get the people who are actually using parking to pay for it as they go, rather than have it sit there and be paid for out of some general fund so that folks who never use it wind up subsidizing it.

Dr. Morgan: Could I ask a question along those lines?

Mr. Silverman: Yeah.

Dr. Morgan: As was remarked by Chris Locke, the owners of the Newark Shopping Center aggressively tow people. Now I have wondered why the Newark Shopping Center doesn't either come to some arrangement with the City where it allows the City to manage that lot and the Newark Shopping Center could simply validate the parking of their customers or . . . it just seems to me that would be win/win situation.

Mr. Silverman: It's been my observation that in the desire of the City to meet suburban parking lot standards, that probably one-third of the available parking space in the old, pre-

modernization disappear. They are tight on parking in there. If you go in there right now at 3:00 p.m., outside of some fringe parking spaces, they're tight.

Mr. Jones: It's certainly not empty like it was 30 years ago.

Mr. Silverman: No. And it's not because the square footage is leased. It's the activity and, I think, the shrinking of the lots. And when the movie theater is not playing, there are parking spaces. When the movie theater is active, you lose those parking spaces. So I don't think we have the flexibility that we used to have.

Mr. Cappiello: So do you think even though the new apartment behind there has their own parking, is there overflow . . .

Mr. Jones: Maybe some of their guests, probably . . .

Mr. Cappiello: Yeah, so I don't know how they work. Do they get a spot for their car but yet their friends that are coming to visit . . .

Mr. Silverman: Well the way it's designed there, there's a quite a bit of parking in a horseshoe-shaped courtyard . . .

Mr. Jones: Right.

Mr. Silverman: Where Capriotti's is.

Mr. Cappiello: Yeah.

Mr. Silverman: Back in there, there's probably 25-30 places for guests.

Mr. Jones: But still there's how many units in that building?

Mr. Silverman: I know there's a lot of units.

Mr. Jones: On Friday night, 25 guests . . .

Mr. Cappiello: You could be talking one apartment.

Mr. Silverman: That's why I think that kind of management may or may not work. It's an idea to bring up. Kind of at the other end of town, we need something to start driving people to the University building. It's my perception the University doesn't want to put out the electric sign that says park here. It isn't part of their whole atmosphere. But maybe if through this icon business, the parking building is shown and if they had a sensor system showing 35 spaces available and somebody says, hey, it's a nice day. I'm going down to . . .

Mr. Cappiello: There's nothing to stop a non-University guest from pulling in there.

Mr. Silverman: No.

Mr. Cappiello: If someone is going to eat at Gelato and they don't mind walking, park in there and walk back.

Mr. Silverman: I think it's part of the University culture. They do not encourage it.

Mr. Cappiello: So if I have a concert at the church and I say, I'm really sorry, you know, we can take care of the bodies in the building, but the cars . . . there's a parking garage right down the street. Two blocks away, if you don't mind walking.

Mr. Silverman: You could. But the University isn't going to take out an ad in your Sunday bulletin saying come park here for \$5.00 or \$2.00, or if you're out by 12:00, it's free, or one of those.

Dr. Morgan: Or if you look at the map, even closer to the church is the Pearson lot.

Mr. Silverman: Yeah.

Mr. Cappiello: That's right.

Dr. Morgan: I mean that's less than a five minute walk, right?

Mr. Cappiello: Yeah, and once you park there, you can actually cut between or around buildings and you don't have to walk around.

Mr. Silverman: Dr. Morgan . . . I'm sorry . . . is that a metered lot? Pearson?

Dr. Morgan: I think it's only . . . they may have a couple of meters but . . .

Mr. Cappiello: A couple of meters.

Dr. Morgan: Yeah, just a few meters.

Mr. Jones: Mostly permit.

Dr. Morgan: But mostly permits.

Mr. Silverman: See, this is where I was hoping we could get the University . . . like permit parking for the professor who is there, or the workers, they're not there on Saturday or Sunday.

Mr. Jones: Yes.

Dr. Morgan: I agree. I agree completely. But let me also say, there is no shortage, from my observation of Lot 1, there is absolutely no shortage of parking in Lot 1 on weekends at any time of the day – lunch, dinner, whatever. And I would like to say that, I'd like to qualify what Chris Locke is saying about the countdown signs. It is indeed true that around lunchtime, the number of available spaces in Lot 1 is very small, and sometimes 0.

Mr. Silverman: Which you would expect.

Dr. Morgan: But at dinner time, I've almost always seen at least a couple dozen spaces available . . .

Mr. Silverman: I was wondering about that.

Dr. Morgan: At dinner time, there's no . . .

Mr. Silverman: But for the first time we can ask to get hard data.

Dr. Morgan: Right. Yes.

Mr. Silverman: You've got your field observations . . .

Dr. Morgan: Right.

Mr. Silverman: And the other thing that we don't talk about is, with the amount of surveillance in Newark, which was touched on by our speaker . . .

Mr. Jones: Right.

Mr. Silverman: I can sit there and I can do a sample. Let's see what the parking lot looks like between 8:00 a.m. and 9:00 a.m.

Dr. Morgan: Right. Yes.

Mr. Silverman: Oh, there are 10-12 spaces on the average. Let's see what it looks like at noon. There are three spaces. Let's see what it looks like at 3:00 p.m. And I can sit here. I don't have to have expensive field people. I don't have to have electronic pick-up. I can do a number of observations . . .

Dr. Morgan: Yes. And may I just say, I think it's very important that the City compile reasonably accurate average occupancy of Lot 1 for the next several months. I mean the next couple of weeks are going to be anomalous . . .

Mr. Silverman: Sure.

Dr. Morgan: Because it's vacation time. And January will be anomalous because the number of students in town for the winter session is much smaller.

Mr. Silverman: But it's valuable because it shows the reciprocal of when the University is back.

Dr. Morgan: Yes, that's right. So really the February, March, April time, occupancies will be very, very helpful.

Mr. Silverman: And along with some of those community university-wide events.

Dr. Morgan: Right.

Mr. Silverman: Alumni Weekend. What does it do? What does it do to your parking problem on a Sunday?

Mr. Cappiello: Yeah, I mean it's one of those things. We try to deal with it because we know it's coming. And we sit down and have our weekly staff meetings and say don't forget, next week is this . . .

Mr. Jones: Event. Yeah.

Mr. Cappiello: And we try to say what's going to be the impact with what we have on, and we will potentially try to plan, or not plan, events that we think would impact the traffic flow for us.

Dr. Morgan: Well let me . . .

Mr. Jones: Hang on a second. The kind of sampling you're talking about just happens to be one of my strong suits. I'm real good at walking around parking lots, saying there's a car, there's no car. And we're talking about once an hour. You wouldn't have to do it every day for seven months, but certainly a Monday, a Wednesday, a Friday and spread it out from 8:00 a.m. until . . . I'm not sure how late I could stay up . . . but I'd be happy once the spring semester gets started if nobody else in the City is equipped to do this and you always have to volunteer to do it, I'll go out there and do some counting for you.

Mr. Silverman: So rather than you going out and doing some counting, let's get permission for him to . . .

Mr. Jones: Or give me access to the security camera and I can do it that way.

Ms. Gray: You're looking at me like I have direction. Parking is not underneath me right now, so you'd have to give that direction to others.

Mr. Silverman: Well, I'm saying . . .

Ms. Gray: No, I agree with all of that.

Mr. Jones: Put it this way, if you need some muscle to do any of this, I'm willing to get involved.

Ms. Gray: Yeah, that'd be great.

Dr. Morgan: Let me say, initially there were some glitches. Like there was one occasion when the countdown sign said 0 and I counted eight empty spaces in Lot 1.

Mr. Silverman: Okay.

Dr. Morgan: But that seems to have been corrected. But you don't need to do counts. I mean if the countdown signs are accurate, all they need to do is record the data . . .

Mr. Jones: But one of the reasons we're doing counts would be to spot check the countdown data to make sure . . .

Dr. Morgan: Yes, that has to be done, too.

Mr. Silverman: It'd be a ground (inaudible).

Mr. Jones: And whether I do it with the camera or physically do it, Lot 1 is not that big. It's the sort of thing I could do the whole count each time in about five minutes.

Mr. Silverman: Now something I think is significant from an economic point of view that we talked about earlier is decoupling parking from the use.

Mr. Jones: Right.

Mr. Silverman: From an economic point of view, if I want to build to the maximum permitted lot coverage, and then contractually or however the range for my parking obligation could be managed elsewhere, I should be able to do that. Now other jurisdictions – Hartford and Rochester, New York – have done that. And they looked at their building permit activity, and they found that a lot of the older buildings that were obsolete were coming back online for putting renovation money in because they didn't have to tear off the back of the building to create parking spaces. And it also allows some of these little [inaudible] circumstances that we have in Newark where somebody took what had been an alleyway . . .

Mr. Jones: Squeezed in Newark Newsstand.

Mr. Silverman: And put a 22 foot wide Newark Newsstand. Put a 22 foot wide building in there.

Mr. Jones: Yeah.

Mr. Silverman: Well that gentleman was trying to put two rental units over top of his building, but it didn't work because of the parking requirements and the parking waiver costs. But that's a lost renovation on Main Street and lost tax revenue. And, again, if the theory is to concentrate our student population, that 24-hour a day activity, and move it away from the quieter residential areas, that's something that would work in our favor. The other thing which really gets a little fuzzy and I'll just close my comments out on this is, anecdotally, and just based on a lot of years of looking at land use patterns, I believe we're starting to reach the point of saturation where the rental units being built are reaching equilibrium with the

demand. And I think when we come into that point, we're going to see some of these older buildings, converted 18th and 19th century houses, either be reconstructed or we're going to see rents starting to lower.

Mr. Cappiello: Right, then competing with the empty space, so are you willing to take \$20 less a month . . .

Mr. Silverman: Which opens up opportunities for non-students. And we have a . . . something I'm becoming very aware of . . . an aging population that is downsizing. And I don't want to downsize to Jenner's Pond in Pennsylvania. I'd like to be able to afford to downsize on Main Street in Newark.

Mr. Cappiello: Wasn't that one of the primary marketing points for the Stone Balloon? Was to be an upscale retirement type . . .

Mr. Jones: Yeah.

Mr. Silverman: Yeah.

Dr. Morgan: But it didn't turn out that way.

Mr. Jones: I know something about why it might not have turned out that way. I mean, not so much the Stone Balloon per se, but this was a big thing in West Chester through 2010. And in 2010 what happened? The stock market collapsed in 2008 and ripple effects made it down to the local level by 2010, and we had projects approved for upscale housing of the kind you're talking about . . .

Mr. Silverman: Yeah.

Mr. Jones: Then when the developers already had the approvals done and decided not to go forward with it because their economic analysis was they would not be able to find enough people to go move into it.

Mr. Silverman: Yeah, can I afford \$300-400 thousand for a condominium plus monthly condominium fees? No.

Mr. Jones: That's what we're talking about. And so what you do have here is you have a student body that's relatively affluent and apparently you've figured out how to get people to build those things to take those students in, but there is a kind of a trade-off here. The more of that that happens, the less likely you are to get the person who wants to spend \$300 thousand to go live across the alley from them.

Mr. Silverman: But there's another phenomenon out there. Again, it's in the reading but it hasn't hit this area. There's something called cohousing. C-O-housing. And we're seeing it with University students. But there's a whole group of millennial populations where there are jobs that support the millennial population where I want my privacy, but I also want a washer and dryer unit over there.

Mr. Jones: Right.

Mr. Silverman: And I want a kitchen and a common sitting area when I have friends over. But I don't want to rent 700 square feet for my room. I'm happy to have 400 square feet.

Mr. Cappiello: So it's like the Towers.

Mr. Silverman: Yeah.

Mr. Cappiello: Although the Towers are very old, that's the same thing.

Mr. Jones: It's like a really deluxe dormitory.

Mr. Cappiello: Yeah, the Towers was the bedrooms around a central, common sitting area and kitchenette. And so you went to your bedroom but you shared the middle area.

Mr. Silverman: In my freshman year in college, I lived in that arrangement and we loved it. And it was decent construction. You closed your door. There were concrete block walls. The noise was out there and the quiet was in your study bedroom. And then to the aging population, again, there may be people who are widows or widowers who are still active . . .

Mr. Jones: Right.

Mr. Silverman: Who want that privacy. I have a place to go to watch TV. I have my own bathroom. Maybe I've got a small food preparation area. But when I don't turn up at 9:00 a.m., my regular pattern, there are knocks on my door.

Mr. Cappiello: Right.

Mr. Jones: There are two projects like that in West Chester. The first one was 64 units, which only came with 24 parking spaces for the entire building.

Mr. Silverman: Okay.

Mr. Jones: It sold out before it was finished. The second one is a bigger one. That's 240 units. It's got 200 parking spaces, and that's wound up getting so many awards from the greater Philadelphia area as being the greatest place in the world developed in the last three years. They both have been widely successful, I would say.

Mr. Silverman: For an aging population, there's tremendous demand. If I want to go to Florida, I tell the people on my floor . . .

Mr. Cappiello: In your pod.

Mr. Silverman: My pod . . .

Mr. Jones: Yeah, pick up my newspaper. I'll be back in about . . .

Mr. Silverman: I'll be back in three weeks. Or I have a bunch of friends and we have tickets to go to the Caribbean. I don't have to worry about snow. I don't have to worry about maintenance. I know what my fixed costs are. I know what my common costs are. So this notion of we're building for students, even if we overbuild for that four and five bedroom cluster, providing it's decent, I believe there's a population out there, when the price gets down below \$500 a month per bedroom or per person, that we'll see people backfill that.

Mr. Jones: They didn't pull that off in West Chester, but I still think you're right. And the one thing I want to say is that part of the argument, the political argument about you're building for students, what the real question is, is if the thing you're building doesn't work the way you want it to, then what are you going to do with it? And all anybody who can oppose it can imagine is you're going to put students in there. So that's why you either have to prove to them it's going to be successful or else you've got to go incorporate into the design something that's going to make it not work well for students.

Mr. Silverman: Yeah, which could be reduce the number of automobiles.

Mr. Jones: Yeah.

Mr. Silverman: And maybe you only have one-third of the automobiles.

Dr. Morgan: If I could give you a little bit of a counter-argument based on what I know the University's plans are, they definitely have a plan to increase substantially the number of undergraduates and the number of graduate students. And there's going to be an emphasis on increasing the number of students who are able to pay full tuition from overseas.

Mr. Cappiello: More affluent.

Dr. Morgan: More affluent people. And, in particular, from countries like China and Saudi Arabia. And I have heard, for example, that some of these more affluent Chinese students are having their parents buy houses in Old Newark and then renting them out, perhaps not in total compliance with regulations . . .

Mr. Silverman: I'm going to sound prejudiced when I say less than contemporary community standards on occupancy.

Dr. Morgan: Right. Okay. And, I mean, renting them out to four, five or six unrelated people, right. But the people who can afford to buy a house in Old Newark for half a million dollars can also afford to buy an apartment in Washington House or whatever, and I just think that I don't think you're ever likely to see rents going down significantly within walking distance of the University.

Mr. Silverman: You may not. You may not.

Dr. Morgan: I don't think you're ever going to see that. And I think that we need to just focus on, I mean I think if we're going to be talking about the economics of parking, one of the short-term issues we can be focusing on, right, is how high can parking rates be raised without having a significant negative impact on current businesses on Main Street. And then is there something we can do with adjusting the rates in the lots to balance out the demand at peak times?

Mr. Silverman: So if I'm a restaurant-goer, I don't have my dinner hour until 7:00 p.m. instead of 6:00 p.m.?

Dr. Morgan: Well, no. What I'm saying is that if we're the City, we adjust the rates for parking in the lots so that, for example, there's no doubt that the peak occupancy time for Lot 1 is basically from let's say 10:00 a.m. until 4:00 p.m. So within that interval of time, we charge \$2.00 an hour to park there, but you're still charging only \$1.00 an hour in Lot 3 and Lot 4. And then as long as the weather is not terrible, students will park in the more distant lots and walk an extra five minutes to class and an extra five minutes to come back.

Mr. Cappiello: So I agree and I had mentioned that point when we first started.

Dr. Morgan: Yeah.

Mr. Cappiello: And I really believe that. And I have a younger person that works at the church and I said I'm going to this parking meeting and one of my thoughts was you could drive people by the dollar. If it costs \$0.50 more an hour to park there and it's cheaper over there, people will figure it out and they'll go to the cheapest spot. And she said, you know, I'm a millennial. I don't even look at the rate. I just take out my debit card, put it in there and walk.

Mr. Silverman: Yeah, that's . . .

Mr. Cappiello: And I went, you just shot a whole big hole in everything I thought was right . . .

Mr. Silverman: That's true.

Mr. Cappiello: And then I had to take a pause back and say maybe it's just me that looks at the price and would be willing to park across the street.

Mr. Silverman: You're showing your age.

Mr. Cappiello: Maybe I'm just cheap.

Mr. Jones: [inaudible] and their kids learn it from them.

Dr. Morgan: Well, let me say I have no doubt there are some students like that. And I'll bet that their parents are paying their credit card bills. But if a student is paying his or her own way, working a job on Main Street that pays \$10.00 an hour . . .

Mr. Jones: And they're parking in your space.

Dr. Morgan: Saving a buck an hour on parking is worth it . . .

Mr. Silverman: That's real money.

Dr. Morgan: For an eight hour day. Right?

Mr. Cappiello: Right.

Dr. Morgan: Now it might not be worth it if you're just going to class for 90 minutes. Right? But if you're looking at an eight hour workday . . .

Mr. Cappiello: Right.

Dr. Morgan: You're saving \$8.00.

Mr. Cappiello: Yeah, absolutely. When my son got his offer to extend his job to work at Aramark over the summer, he was all excited. He said they're going to pay me? I'm working 40 hours a week, Dad. This is going to be great. I'm going to have so much money. And I just sat and listened. And after the first day, he's like, oh man, I have to pay for parking every day. You know how much that's going to be for a week? Do you know what that's going to cost me? And gas. I have to drive from the house to there. And I said, oh, it'd be nice to have another option. Hey, Dad, can I catch a ride with you? And I'll adjust my schedule to wait for you when you get out of work and I'll meet you at the church if you're willing to drive me every day.

Mr. Silverman: Good for him.

Mr. Cappiello: And all of a sudden he saved gas. He saved parking. So I'm glad that he came to that conclusion after only a day or two.

Mr. Jones: And on his own.

Dr. Morgan: And this is where it's important to keep in mind that the student population at the University covers an extremely broad spectrum.

Mr. Silverman: Yes.

Dr. Morgan: We have children of millionaires, and we also have kids who are having to work their way through school.

Mr. Cappiello: Right. My kids.

Dr. Morgan: And you're never going to shift the whole population. But you only need to shift a little bit.

Mr. Cappiello: Yeah. But now if the University has active plans to solicit this graduate population of payers from overseas, I remind myself, people say, you know, the old stereotypes of you see these Asians and they are so smart, or you see these Indians. And I say do you understand that the ones that you're seeing here are the ones that have the means to get out. Or the drive to get out.

Mr. Silverman: And they competed to get there.

Mr. Cappiello: And competed to get there. You're seeing some of the best ones here. So you get this stereotype. That's not indicative of the whole population.

Mr. Jones: Correct.

Mr. Cappiello: They have the same schlumps that we have. You know, it's just that we don't see them. So when these people are coming in with means, and this effort of trying to drive them somewhere else, this \$2.00 an hour versus \$1.00 is nothing to them.

Dr. Morgan: It may not affect them, but let me say what it will affect is the kids who . . . and it always will be, because you can expect that, roughly speaking, about one-third of the undergraduates at the University will be Delaware residents.

Mr. Cappiello: Right.

Dr. Morgan: And of them, a very substantial fraction need financial aid. So those are the ones who are most likely to be working jobs on Main Street.

BREAKOUT GROUP 3 – PRIVATE/INDEPENDENT LOTS AND EMPLOYEE PARKING (MCINTOSH, MIKLES, RIND, WHITE, ZAPP)

Mr. McIntosh: Okay, so it's on. It's recording.

Mr. Mikles: So, private parking.

Mr. McIntosh: Private parking.

Mr. Rind: There should be none. No private parking. It all belongs to the University and the City.

Mr. McIntosh: Well that should do it. We're good. I have no objection.

Mr. Mikles: Could you frame it a little more?

Mr. McIntosh: There's private lots and they're used exclusively for the owner, but they're not always used.

Mr. Mikles: Right.

Mr. McIntosh: And what happens to them when they're not being used, they sit empty. And we could use them, maybe, you know, if we have some overflow. And I think this map is trying to show us, it's supposed to show us where the private lots are. Mary Ellen, I just need you for a second. Are these the private lots? The blue ones?

Mr. Rind: The blue is the public, pay-to-park lots.

Ms. Gray: Yes.

Mr. Rind: The private is the orange.

Ms. Gray: Orange, yes.

Mr. McIntosh: So give me . . . where is that?

Ms. Gray: Where is that?

Mr. Rind: That is Tyre Avenue.

Mr. McIntosh: Oh, okay.

Ms. Gray: He knows way more than I do. Can I go back?

Mr. McIntosh: Yeah, go ahead.

Ms. Gray: Alright, thank you.

Mr. McIntosh: Why were you here? People just drop in and think they can take over. So it seems to me we have more private lots than that, however. What about . . .

Mr. Mikles: These are probably private multi-use, multi-tenant lots. Right? Like Astra . . . I mean, Newark Shopping Center.

Mr. McIntosh: Well there's a lot that's right on that Peddler's Alley there. Isn't that behind there?

Mr. Rind: It's on here. Trader's Alley.

Mr. McIntosh: Where is that?

Mr. Mikles: Yeah, 183.

Mr. Rind: It's the 183 orange.

Mr. McIntosh: Okay, so that's that. Alright. I'm looking at the wrong thing. So those lots, at least these three – 46, 42, and 183 – they're in pretty good territory.

Mr. Rind: They are.

Ms. Jean White: Yeah. I want to say something about the Trader's Alley. That's why I chose this committee.

Mr. McIntosh: Okay, but let's just . . . we're just trying to get an orientation for the moment.

Ms. White: I understand.

Mr. McIntosh: So then we have outliers at each end. But there's . . . these could be very useful for us in the evening. Like when you have a lot of patrons coming in . . .

Mr. Mikles: Yes.

Mr. McIntosh: And others like you. If we could make some kind of a deal with these people that have that, that might be . . . so that's all I'm saying.

Mr. Mikles: Right.

Mr. McIntosh: It's a resource that is not available to the public at the moment. The other one is not on here at all, and that's College Square.

Mr. Mikles: Yeah.

Mr. McIntosh: Now, I mean, one of these days they're going to develop it. And they're obviously in the throes of doing it now. But I don't know how much . . . they don't seem to be really jumping on it.

Mr. Mikles: Right.

Mr. McIntosh: So if we combine that with the discussion we had about the trolley last month, so if the trolley goes through here, right, on a regular basis, not like it did the first time there was a trolley, but if it's on a regular basis, that could be useful to the employees. That's where they park.

Mr. Mikles: Right.

Mr. McIntosh: And there's a trolley that comes through here regularly so it's not a problem for them to get to wherever they're going and it has multiple stops as it goes down Main Street. But as one trolley is, you know, give it a five minute head-start, and then another trolley goes. And you just keep working that and they'll have people on it or not have people on it. It doesn't matter. It just keeps working.

Mr. Mikles: Another one that's in there is the University bio, the . . .

Mr. Rind: The DBI.

Mr. Mikles: DBI. Delaware Biotech.

Mr. Rind: It has a lot of different names. It confuses me, even. The technology Park there.

Mr. Mikles: If you're going to make some effort to go to College Square, although that probably would satisfy most of the demand, that's right there.

Mr. Rind: Yeah, that's all empty nights and weekends, also.

Mr. McIntosh: Where is that?

Mr. Rind: Wyoming Road and . . .

Mr. Mikles: Right behind Pep Boys. Delaware Biotech.

Mr. Rind: Chapel.

Mr. McIntosh: Pep Boys. Manny, Moe and Jack.

Mr. Mikles: Just behind that there's a University, or quasi-University . . .

Mr. McIntosh: That's right, I know exactly where you're talking about.

Mr. Rind: Yeah.

Mr. Mikles: And that's another one that is, like you're saying . . .

Mr. Rind: It's all daytime use.

Mr. Mikles: All daytime. So if you're sending a trolley that way, it might be part of the conversation.

Mr. McIntosh: So that's what this is about. How do we pick up spaces and put people into those spaces that don't need to get some place quickly. They're on the job and start at 4 and they're there until midnight or 10:00 p.m. You know, they're not going to their car. And it will be safer for them because we're going to put them on a trolley and drop them off at their car, basically. So that's what this is about. Trying to determine how we can utilize the space that exists and have an alternative use for it when it's not being used in its primary way. Now we would have to probably do something with the good folks over at College Square, but it would seem to me that any revenue you can get would be a plus for them.

Mr. Rind: But you don't even need to go that far because you have this enormous parking lot of mine, which we already designed a permit that we would sell to merchants to park there.

Mr. McIntosh: Well that's . . .

Mr. Rind: After 4:00 p.m. and all day on weekends. And nobody will buy it.

Mr. Matt Zapp: Which lot is that?

Ms. White: Is this behind . . .

Mr. Rind: The lot behind Pearson and Graham Hall.

Mr. Zapp: Yeah, that's a lot of parking.

Mr. Rind: It's 500+ spaces. And it's walking distance.

Mr. Mikles: Absolutely.

Mr. Zapp: Sure.

Mr. Mikles: You don't have to cross . . .

Mr. Zapp: If I could just interject real quick. My guess is that College Square is a stretch. I think that employees would find it a little bit intimidating. There's too much crime over there [inaudible]. But my guess is that my employees would not have wanted to park there and hop on a trolley. Because it's so, people don't even go outside of Main Street. Yeah, one after the other and maybe Chapel to the Deer Park is kind of a cohesive . . . but it's even more localized than that. And then if you start talking about College Square, I think it's going to be a tough draw. I don't think you're going to get a lot of usage there, is my guess. I think it needs to be something more like Academy or somewhere that kind of feels like it's more of that Main Street zone that attracts interest.

Mr. Locke: See you guys.

Mr. Zapp: I think it would be tough to draw interest.

Ms. White: Maybe after it's developed more, there might be . . .

Mr. Zapp: Maybe after it's developed more, yeah, possibly.

Mr. Rind: Well if it's developed more, it might become a destination of its own.

Mr. Zapp: Exactly.

Mr. Mikles: They might need their spots.

Mr. Rind: They might. Hopefully, right, for their purposes. Hopefully they will need them.

Mr. Zapp: I think it's going to be a tough draw. I think it would sound good, but I think to get a young employee to want to park over there and hop on a trolley, I think it's a tough draw. Whereas if it was Academy, it would be more comfortable. There's just more University police presence and things like that. I think it would be an easier draw.

Ms. White: I think so too.

Mr. McIntosh: So this lot here would probably . . . what did you say, 500 spaces?

Mr. Rind: It's over 500 spaces.

Mr. Mikles: What's the monthly permit?

Mr. Rind: Well the daytime permit is very expensive and I don't have room in there during the daytime.

Mr. Mikles: Right.

Mr. Rind: But nights and weekends we've created a permit specifically at the request of the merchants on Main Street . . . Ryan German mostly . . . starting at 4:00 p.m. on weekdays and all day on weekends, they could buy. And it was, I don't remember the price of it off the top of my head, but it was very inexpensive. But it was an annual permit. So it was designed around employees.

Mr. Mikles: Is it annual . . . I'm really interested in this because I think this will help frame what this structure would need to look like. Is it annual tied to the car? Or is it annual tied to the business?

Mr. Rind: To the purchaser. So the car.

Mr. Mikles: So if I bought it, if I bought it and gave it to an employee, how would that get assigned to them?

Mr. Rind: You wouldn't be able to physically give it to an employee because it's all done through the license plate of the car . . .

Mr. Mikles: Okay.

Mr. Rind: Is the way we do everything now. So with the exception of Trabant, which is changing. Right now you pull a ticket or waive a badge to get in it. But that's going to change over the summer.

Ms. White: What's it going to be?

Mr. Rind: It's going to be similar to everywhere else. It will be all tied to license plates and by permit with your license plate, and you just drive in and drive out. And if you're a visitor, an hourly parker, you're going to just pay a machine. I'm going to be here for three hours . . . just like a meter . . . I'm going to be here for three hours, here's my license plate number, and then you just leave. So that's what it's going to, sometime in August.

Mr. Mikles: From an employer perspective, one of my challenges would be the rotation of the employees. And so I've got an employee that I would offer this parking spot to, I'd probably try to get involved in some kind of reimbursement with them, but if they're not going to be there . . . if they're a seasonal employee, that wouldn't be of any interest to them on an annual pass basis.

Mr. Rind: And I do understand that. We are expanding the use of our app . . .

Mr. Mikles: Okay.

Mr. Rind: So we have a way to pay through an app . . .

Mr. Mikles: Okay.

Mr. Rind: So that could even be done daily. So there's no reason why we couldn't have a night rate for that lot that's three dollars a night, or whatever it is . . .

Mr. Mikles: Right.

Mr. Rind: And you just pay through your phone. So when you're here, you pay. And when you're not, you don't. And it's tied to license plates also.

Mr. Mikles: Right.

Mr. Rind: There's ways to do that.

Mr. Mikles: I think something like that . . .

Mr. Rind: Absolutely there's ways to do that.

Mr. Mikles: For an employer, it's close, it's safe, it's walkable . . .

Mr. Zapp: It's familiar for University students.

Mr. Rind: Yes. And you have the overlay of the University police on top of the City police, which you wouldn't have in some of the further flung areas.

Mr. Zapp: So many of my employees, when I owned a business on Main Street, were Delaware kids but not live on campus kids.

Mr. Rind: Right.

Mr. Zapp: So they would like the comfort of campus but aren't walking currently. They have to drive in like anybody else.

Mr. Rind: Right.

Mr. Zapp: But they would appreciate the comfort of campus, I think. And they're the type of kids that tend to work part-time jobs. They're not as well, kind of, capitalized as the out of state kids.

Mr. Mikles: So part of the structure that would be desirable would be something that could be tied to the individual but on a daily basis. And I'm thinking like could we, if we came up with this ideal model, could we apply it to . . . is there any way we could have a conversation with Newark Shopping Center and say, look, we're going to follow this daily model. I don't know what it is, but \$3.00 a day or whatever it is, you know, overnight and after 4:00 p.m. for these certain lots, we're going to put a pass in the car. We're going to do something . . .

Mr. Rind: Yeah.

Mr. Mikles: If we can come to that sort of framework with them as well, like that . . .

Mr. Rind: Well that was, actually he's going right where I was going, too, is who controls all of these? Are they twelve different people . . .

Mr. Mikles: Yeah.

Mr. Rind: Or is it just one for each lot? Because if it's just one for each lot, it's a lot easier.

Mr. Mikles: No, it's different people. Now they might have the same towing company.

Mr. Rind: Well it's the same towing company I have, too, I'm sure, but that doesn't . . .

Mr. McIntosh: Yeah, we're trying to avoid that.

Mr. Rind: Yeah, we don't want to tow anybody. But you know what I'm saying. At least Newark Shopping Center, it's one landlord that you talk to and say, hey, we want you to rent your parking lot out at night, and you're going to make a lot of money doing it. Or whatever.

Mr. Mikles: Right.

Mr. Rind: But these individual ones, is it like each business gets a couple of spaces in each of these lots? Or I don't know how that works.

Mr. Mikles: Well Newark manages their own as a property. What's the 183? Trader's Alley? That's the Iron Hill one.

Mr. Rind: Yeah, so who enforces that?

Mr. Mikles: I don't think anybody does.

Mr. Rind: Who manages that?

Ms. White: Okay, so I'm going to speak and I'm sure most of you know this already. As John Morgan has very nicely at previous meetings has said, when that was approved, back when it was approved there, that was to be managed between . . . there's Cameras, Etc. here and there's Iron Hill Brewery and everything . . . that was to be controlled by them. And that never happened.

Mr. Rind: Controlled by the tenants?

Ms. White: Well not by the . . . well, I guess the tenants. The businesses and everything somehow. He has all the information on that back a year or two ago that he researched very nicely. And that was a requirement, but they never followed through. So that's an open lot parked, I think, probably mostly by University students.

Mr. Rind: I'm sure.

Ms. White: In fact you probably heard the student, the undergraduate there . . .

Mr. Rind: Yes.

Ms. White: He said that's known by students as the free place to park.

Mr. Rind: As a place to hide.

Ms. White: And I'm telling you, I go to Cameras, Etc., I went to Bloom, and three different times I tried to park in there to go to Bloom just in the last two weeks, and the lot was full. I have this thing, since we're talking about parking that I will not put money in a meter because I object to how much already it is. I know everybody wants to raise it further, but I'm not going to put in a quarter and get twelve minutes. So if I'm shopping at one of these two, I want to park in there, and you can't find a parking place. And all these people . . . now the Iron Hill Brewery, I think there's six apartments and each one gets one free parking place, and they're numbered one through six. Those are right down here. But the rest of them . . .

Mr. Rind: But the rest of them are just free to anybody.

Ms. White: The rest of them are just free. Now as you probably know, there was something that was approved . . . there was a legal dispute over it and everything. I think it's the . . . I don't see the building going through. . . they want to build a three or four story building there and that hasn't happened so far. But anyway, something has to be done about this lot.

Mr. Mikles: But they're choosing to manage it by not . . .

Mr. Rind: By not managing it.

Mr. Mikles: Which is . . . I mean that's their choice.

Ms. White: I don't even know that they're choosing.

Mr. Zapp: They used to put an attendant out there.

Mr. Mikles: Yeah, I don't think they do anymore.

Mr. Zapp: Right, they haven't done it in years.

Mr. McIntosh: There was some discussion we had at the Commission about this very lot not too long ago.

Ms. White: I thought it was about the development project that came . . .

Mr. McIntosh: Yes, but there was a lot of discussion about the parking back there and . . .

Ms. White: Because the builder, Gus' daughter . . . there was going to be parking on the first floor of this building that's put in but it still wasn't going to be managed with gates or anything else.

Mr. McIntosh: Yeah, there was one fellow saying we don't want cars in there but we don't have any way of stopping them.

Ms. White: No, I don't know.

Mr. McIntosh: I think that was the general tenor of the discussion.

Ms. White: It wasn't up to the City Council or Planning Commission, but I mean I would think that the businesses affected or the Iron Hill Brewery or whatever, they would want . . . you know, business on both sides only want their customers parking there. With maybe some others.

Mr. Mikles: Right.

Ms. White: And it just . . .

Mr. Mikles: So it's hurting them as much . . .

Ms. White: It's just a free . . .

Mr. Rind: I mean the signs I'm sure say that you have to be visiting one of these places to go in there, I would assume.

Mr. Mikles: They do.

Ms. White: I haven't looked around for the signs.

Mr. Rind: But if nobody is enforcing it, they might as well just take them down.

Mr. Zapp: They'd almost be better off with meters in there, where they participate in the revenue somehow.

Mr. Rind: Absolutely. That's exactly right.

Mr. Zapp: So that way they kind of get the best of both worlds. It would discourage kind of the freeloaders who aren't even patrons . . .

Mr. Rind: Because you've got these pockets of free mixed in with all of these people that are charging. And so everybody goes to the free ones.

Mr. Mikles: But that's sort of their issue. I mean, yes, they may be losing value on that, but in terms of us, how do we deal with managing and getting the most effective private parking . . . I don't think we can solve their problem here.

Ms. White: Well I don't know if it's their problem, it's just that their customers . . . I was a customer . . . can't get a parking space.

Mr. Mikles: Then that's their problem though. Because it's their customer.

Mr. Zapp: Right, because they're not going to shop there.

Mr. Rind: And that forces you to pay.

Ms. White: Well, no. I'm not going to pay . . .

Mr. Rind: Well you're not, but other customers will pay begrudgingly.

Ms. White: They might.

Mr. McIntosh: Well it's interesting because I had lunch with somebody a few weeks ago and I parked across from Taverna at that lot, and I parked in there. And I said so where are you parked? He said, oh, I'm in the free lot. I said where's that?

Mr. Zapp: I think Chris Locke has a similar lot behind where my business was at Yogoberry, at 129 East Main Street.

Mr. Rind: Yes.

Mr. Zapp: It was kind of like a little bit of a secret lot. It's only towed if physically Chris shows up and visually says I know that person doesn't work for one of my tenants, I know that person doesn't work for one of my tenants, and he starts towing.

Mr. Mikles: So it's a pretty high bar for that to happen.

Mr. Zapp: Right. Yeah.

Mr. Rind: There has to be almost a crisis.

Mr. McIntosh: With Chris, it's something else that brought him down there.

Ms. White: What used to be there? Is this where Taverna is?

Mr. Zapp: Sort of. Adjacent to Taverna. It's where now Roots Natural Kitchen is.

Ms. White: Oh, okay.

Mr. Zapp: So behind that.

Mr. Rind: I have a daughter that lived in that building too, and I used that lot all the time.

Mr. McIntosh: The free lot.

Mr. Rind: Because it was a free lot.

Mr. McIntosh: I think that's the one he was talking about.

Mr. Mikles: What about the parking that the University has over here? Isn't there . . .

Mr. Rind: Yeah, up here.

Mr. Mikles: What about that?

Mr. Rind: Same thing. We could do it exactly the same way.

Mr. Mikles: Yeah, so right here there's a huge lot and Trabant addresses it, as well. There's parking available and if we could come up with that sort of nighttime pay-by app, I think that would be a huge win for employers to give employees. It's like right here.

Mr. McIntosh: Yeah, I know . . . yeah.

Ms. White: Where the art building is.

Mr. Rind: Yeah, the studio arts building.

Mr. McIntosh: It just seems to me that if you had one here, one here, and one here . . .

Mr. Rind: You've got all the corners covered. And then Trabant is already there.

Mr. McIntosh: Well and I parked there the other day. I had a lot of trouble finding a space. I said where the hell are all these spaces he's talking about?

Mr. Rind: They're on the roof, mostly.

Mr. McIntosh: Yeah, well I didn't want to be on the roof.

Mr. Rind: What difference does it make?

Mr. McIntosh: Well I was very close. I think . . .

Mr. Rind: What difference does it make?

Mr. Mikles: Everyone wants their parking . . .

Mr. Rind: Honest to God, we get complaints when people say, you know, I have a permit for the Trabant garage and when I parked there yesterday, I had to park on the roof.

Mr. McIntosh: Yeah.

Mr. Rind: And when we get that, we look at that email like what am I supposed to say to that? Did you find a space? And the answer is yes. Then you got what you paid for.

Mr. McIntosh: But my car gets dirty.

Ms. White: But when it's snowing . . .

Mr. Rind: Of course, but we don't advertise it as indoor parking.

Mr. McIntosh: He doesn't care about my car getting dirty. He doesn't.

Mr. Rind: It's not indoor parking.

Ms. White: Yeah but I mean you wouldn't want to park on the roof when it's snowing.

Mr. Rind: Agreed. Oh, well. Then get there earlier.

Mr. Mikles: These two would be great to address the University lots if we can work with them on coming up with a pay-by app nightly option or something like that.

Mr. McIntosh: Now it doesn't address it during the day . . .

Mr. Rind: No.

Mr. McIntosh: But I don't know . . . I have never had a problem parking downtown.

Mr. Zapp: There's only one daytime problem, and that's Lot 1. That's it. And so that has to be solved either with raising the rates just there, just daytime, so that way it's not less expensive for the students to park there than the garage. Has that been addressed yet?

Mr. Rind: No, it has not.

Mr. Zapp: So I think that, to me, I don't know the whole story, but to me that's like kind of an instant fix. If those prices exceeded . . .

Mr. Rind: The garage.

Mr. Zapp: The garage just for those hours, then you have solved the Lot 1 problem. To me, you have a Lot 1 problem during the day and you have a Lot 4 problem at night.

Mr. Rind: Where's Lot 4?

Mr. Zapp: Lot 4 is behind Panera.

Mr. Rind: Oh, I got it. There's a nice #4 in the middle of it.

Mr. Zapp: And Lot 3 . . .

Mr. McIntosh: Where do you see the number 4?

Mr. Rind: It's small but it's there.

Mr. Zapp: But Lot 4 is, by far, the most desired evening lot. By miles. I delivered pizzas for Margherita's for 17 years and so I had to go into that lot 30 times a night, so it was a massive source of frustration because it was always . . . the guy has to get out of the booth, he has to put a sign up that says the lot is full, but it's only full for a second . . .

Mr. Rind: Until the first car leaves, right.

Mr. Zapp: Until the next car pulls out. So it's a bit of a disaster. So you have a Lot 1 problem by day and you have a Lot 4 problem at night. Because that's where all the most desirable restaurants are. And Lot 3, which is kind of the biggest of all of them . . .

Mr. Rind: And it's the most centrally located.

Mr. Zapp: Is underutilized. And I'm not exactly sure why it's underutilized. I think part of it is kind of signage. The alleyways in are very, very small, and not well noticed. And then people want to walk such short distances that if they want to go to Iron Hill or Starbucks, they don't even want to walk the full block . . .

Mr. Rind: No, they're going to move . . .

Mr. Zapp: From Lot 3. They want wrestle and do circles in Lot 4.

Mr. Mikles: Right.

Mr. Zapp: Just to give you some local perspective.

Mr. Rind: No, and I . . . I think at the last meeting somebody presented like, I think it was Mike Fortner, the overlay of what the mall parking looks like.

Mr. Mikles: Right.

Mr. Rind: And when I'm trying to go to Macy's, I'm parking way further away than here to there. And yet that's okay. But here it's not okay.

Mr. McIntosh: It's expected. It's an expectation that you're going to park on the other side of the universe. But if it's going downtown, I've got to be right there.

Mr. Zapp: Is there any possibility that the Newark Shopping Center folks would be interested in having meters at that front-most portion? Because then you might be able to add 20 meters. And everybody's looking to park there, kind of, for free. If you're going to walk Main Street, you don't try to cheat the system by parking by the movie theater.

Mr. Rind: No.

Mr. Zapp: You cheat the system by parking close to the street.

Mr. Rind: As close to Main Street as possible. So if they peeled off like one-third of their lot and said this is . . .

Mr. Zapp: Just that front portion that's furthest away from the businesses . . .

Ms. White: Just 10% of the lot.

Mr. Zapp: And it wouldn't interfere. And then maybe they're free by day but maybe pay by night . . .

Mr. Rind: That's right.

Mr. Zapp: So people can kind of park more fearlessly and just pay.

Ms. White: And I think they let the . . .

Mr. Zapp: You could add meters there.

Mr. Rind: I think part of the issue, though, is that somebody, then, has to be in charge of managing it. Of emptying the machine and enforcing the lot and issuing tickets and towing and putting a boot on the car, and all that. Right? Marvin has somebody to do that. I have people to do that. Who is going to do it there? They have to hire somebody.

Mr. Zapp: Where it's sort of joint-operated.

Mr. Rind: They'd have to hire somebody to do it.

Mr. Mikles: Or if we . . . and this gets to sort of coming out with this total package . . . if we came up with a package for these private entities and said after 5:00 p.m., if you agree to allow us to be part of, say, the Newark parking grid, the Newark parking authority will manage it, enforce it and do all that . . .

Mr. Rind: And we'll absorb all the expenses. We'll give you 20% of the revenue, or whatever it is.

Mr. Mikles: Right, so you do some sort of . . . and you present it to them like that . . .

Mr. McIntosh: Yeah, that's the way to go.

Mr. Zapp: But what about liability? Is that an issue?

Mr. Mikles: I'm sure it's solvable. I'm sure there are insurance companies that could figure that out. But I think, like anytime we've gone to Newark Shopping Center at DNP with something, I felt like it's always been sort of a single question ask, not a complete solution. Where I think if we came to all of these entities, maybe even Iron Hill, that lot there, and said we've got a way for you to manage your lot at night and make it a revenue growth for you, and we're going to manage all those aspects of it. If that's something that Newark was willing to do, I think that would free up more private parking options.

Mr. Rind: Correct me if I'm wrong, wasn't Iron Hill the one that was threatening to move off of Main Street because the parking was a headache?

Mr. McIntosh: Yes.

Mr. Rind: It's because they're not controlling the lot. Or somebody is not controlling that lot.

Mr. Zapp: There's too many parties there. That's going to be more pain . . .

Mr. Rind: See, that's the thing. If it was one landlord managing that lot, you'd just go to them.

Mr. Zapp: No, and they all . . . I know some of the land use attorneys that are involved in that case, and there's a lot of bad blood . . .

Mr. McIntosh: Yes.

Mr. Mikles: Between the two parties.

Mr. Zapp: The multiple parties, yeah. So getting those parties to the table over this, to kind of create some solutions for the City, I don't think you'd be able to get them to the table.

Mr. McIntosh: Well, based on the presentation that was being made for the Planning Commission, there was a lot of angst there.

Mr. Zapp: Yeah, there's deeper issues there.

Mr. McIntosh: It was like somebody bring the police in.

Mr. Zapp: I don't think they're going to come to the table.

Mr. McIntosh: Drop to the ground.

Mr. Rind: But they would if they were really serious about solving it.

Mr. Zapp: I think it's . . .

Mr. Rind: At least that would be my argument.

Mr. McIntosh: Well, Iron Hill might be, but the other folks . . .

Mr. Rind: Right. You've got to get them all. It's like herding cats, right? You've got to get them all.

Mr. McIntosh: If it hurts Iron Hill, then they're happy.

Mr. Zapp: There are still lawsuits in the works as far I understand. There's like serious, serious stuff.

Mr. Rind: Really?

Mr. Zapp: Let me ask you this, Lee. What time do your dinner employees start? What's their shift?

Mr. Mikles: They stagger in, but usually around 4:00 p.m.

Mr. Zapp: Gotcha. So I think that you would need, and my guess is that the pressure on your University lots is over way before that . . .

Mr. Rind: Well, just to that point, that was when we met with Ryan German a couple of years back, and Rick Deadwyler, to craft a solution. That's what he said. I said what time do you need? And he say's 4:00. I'm like, fine, you got it.

Mr. Zapp: Right, I think it would have to be kind of a 3:30 to get people to work . . .

Mr. Rind: So we set this up for 4:00 p.m., where our normal restrictions are not relaxed until 5:00 p.m. We did that special just for that lot, just for him. And just for the City, and nobody is buying them.

Mr. Mikles: Okay.

Mr. Rind: But 4:00 p.m. is as early as we would push it because we have capacity issues and needs.

Mr. Zapp: You couldn't go to like 3:30 p.m.?

Mr. Rind: We could not. It was hard to push it to 4:00 p.m. because it's 5:00 p.m. everywhere else.

Mr. McIntosh: But if he did, how would that work for you?

Mr. Mikles: I mean it would be something.

Mr. Rind: It would help.

Mr. Mikles: It would definitely work. Because we have people that come in later. And I also think that these are all conversations, so our start time is based upon certain variables. Well if we said we've got parking at 4:00 p.m., alright, well 4:15 p.m.

Mr. Zapp: If the business owners knew that . . .

Mr. Mikles: It's all part of a conversation.

Mr. Zapp: It's back and forth.

Ms. White: What's your restaurant?

Mr. Mikles: Grain.

Ms. White: Oh, Grain. Okay.

Mr. McIntosh: You just change some things, right?

Mr. Mikles: Right, but there's a reason, too, you know. I also think that if we came up with this model, there's a lot of lots . . . there are some lots on here that aren't even listed, such as churches. So it's a way for them . . .

Mr. Rind: Yeah, I noticed that. Rob's lot is not on here.

Mr. Mikles: They could get money at nighttime.

Mr. McIntosh: Don't mess with God.

Mr. Rind: His lot is not listed as private lot. It should be.

Mr. Zapp: You have to kind of create a target list of which would be the most useful lots . . .

Mr. Rind: Yes, and it's a pretty good size one.

Mr. Mikles: Yeah, and they've got revenue opportunities.

Mr. Zapp: Yeah, exactly.

Mr. Rind: That could further their mission, right?

Mr. Mikles: Right. So it would be a way for us to all work through that. If we offered them a complete package where, again, Newark is going to have to step up and say we're going to manage this, and we'll have to figure out the legal and liability things, but . . . especially if they move to their mobile pay option at some point, it seems like it would be a complete solution.

Mr. Rind: The other thing I just wanted to mention, because this lot behind Barnes & Noble is supposed to be the overflow to Lot 1, but I was over there recently and the sign said 0, so I was intrigued by that and I walked in there . . . I was on foot . . . so I walked in there to see if it was, in fact, accurate. It was. The only spot available was one handicapped spot and you don't want to advertise those as being available because then somebody is going to go in there. But the thing that was interesting is the spitters were still turned on. The ticket dispenser was still turned on, so people still went in there while I was standing there.

Mr. Mikles: Sure, they didn't trust it.

Mr. Rind: Even though it said 0, and they just stalked people as they walked through the lot to see if they were leaving. And they stalked me, but I didn't have a car. So when they realized that I walked all the through and I'm out now, she just parked in one of the drive lanes and she just sat there. And you could tell that her plan was she was going to sit there as long as it took for somebody to leave, and then she was going to take the spot. The thing that was amazing to me is, so I left this lot and walked over to this one, and there were at least 15 spaces there. Why would anybody do that? To save a quarter? Really? Why would anybody do that? It's an eight-hour meter. They could stay there the whole day. So I don't, you know, there's got to be an opportunity to push people . . .

Mr. Zapp: Into that . . .

Mr. Rind: Because okay, the lot said O, but they still went in there.

Mr. Mikles: Right.

Mr. Rind: So if it said O but right below it it said proceed 300 feet further or something . . .

Mr. Zapp: It's not behind them. It's in front of them, so . . .

Mr. Rind: That's right. They don't have to go all the way around.

Mr. Zapp: They don't have to go all the way around.

Mr. Rind: No, it should be a natural thing. If I go in here and it's full, or that sign says O, they should just proceed to the Barnes & Noble lot, but they don't. I don't know why.

Mr. Zapp: I know it's off the subject but when we . . . so I'm part of the development group that's buying 92 East Main and hoping to tear it down and build an apartment building. Full disclosure, I'm part of that . . .

Mr. Rind: What's your name, by the way?

Mr. Zapp: Matt.

Mr. Rind: Matt.

Mr. Zapp: Last name is Zapp, Z-A-P-P.

Mr. Rind: I'm Rich. Hi.

Mr. Zapp: Hi, Rich, nice to meet you. So when I first approached Maureen about this development project, a lot of what was [inaudible] just better signage everywhere. So that kind of speaks to your point. If there is a much better looking, brightly lit sign adjacent to Lot 1 that says these are public meters, I think . . . and like you're saying, there's a lot of open spaces in there . . .

Mr. McIntosh: That's the direction we're going, right.

Mr. Zapp: Yeah.

Mr. Rind: And the sign is the first step in that direction.

Mr. McIntosh: And I don't want to go back to last month again, but it's true. A lot of this is information that people don't have. And if we can get the information out using various sources, continuously, get people to understand that there are parking spaces in Newark. Right? And a lot of people just believe that there are no parking spaces in Newark and why would I go down there?

Mr. Mikles: Right.

Mr. McIntosh: Because I'm going to be hassled. They don't go to Wilmington because they're going to get mugged.

Mr. Mikles: Right.

Mr. McIntosh: Well, how many people get mugged in downtown Wilmington? I mean, yes, does it happen? Of course it happens. Something happens everywhere. But what's the likelihood? The likelihood is that you will always find a parking space if you come to Newark. You might have to walk a little further, but you'll still find it, you know. And so we've got to

back up whatever PR we put behind it with systems. And it seems to me that that belongs to the City Planning Department and Parking Department to do that. Now they might need help. Maybe if we went to all the merchants, maybe, Lee, you could come with us with that. Or if we need to go to the University, well, we'll go to Rich and the like. But, you know, get out there, put a plan together that makes sense, and get an esprit de corps going behind it that says, you know, this is in everybody's best interest, let's do it.

Mr. Zapp: It sounds to me that the opportunity with the University lots has the most promise.

Mr. Rind: Well it does for a couple of reasons. Number one, I'm already at the table and I'm willing to do it. But the thing that I think has been missing, because I've been here 6 ½ years now and I've been saying this stuff from day one, but I'll take anybody's money. Gladly.

Mr. Mikles: Sure.

Mr. Rind: This stuff needs to be said by somebody other than me, because I've been saying it since the day I got here, and everybody's like, oh he just wants everybody to park in his lots. Which I do, but that's not why I'm saying it.

Mr. Mikles: Right.

Mr. Rind: So like we identified all these solutions and a lot of them involve the University. Well, yeah, I stand to benefit from that, absolutely, but so does the City.

Mr. Mikles: Right.

Mr. Zapp: Well everybody has to.

Mr. McIntosh: Why not? What's wrong with that? This is a new conversation. It didn't happen before. Right?

Mr. Mikles: I have to roll.

Mr. McIntosh: Alan, we have to go.

Mr. Mikles: I have to go.

Mr. McIntosh: Thank you.

Mr. Mikles: Thanks for your time.

Mr. McIntosh: Merry Christmas.

Mr. Mikles: Merry Christmas.

Mr. McIntosh: Have a good New Year.

Mr. Mikles: You, too.

Mr. Zapp: Me, as well. Mind if I talk to you on my way out?

Mr. Mikles: Yeah, that'd be great.

Ms. White: [inaudible]

Mr. Rind: We have no issue at all. We welcome public parking. We do.

Mr. Zapp: What is your name again?

Mr. Rind: Rich.

Mr. Zapp: Rich. Great to meet you.

Mr. Rind: I have a business card over there I'll give you. Because we're not-for-profit, we have to be careful about how heavily we advertise for non-University parking.

[Secretary's Note: The breakout sessions ended at 3:45 p.m., at which time members of the Parking Subcommittee reassembled at the front of the room and audience members returned to their original seating.]

5. REPORT-OUTS AND UPGRADES

Mr. McIntosh: Well that was fun, wasn't it?

Ms. Gray: Yeah.

Mr. Silverman: Is it true that you concluded it will not rain in the Newark basins anymore, so we don't have to worry about stormwater?

Mr. McIntosh: I think there was some discussion around that. We were going to point in the direction that rain could go and that would be fun. Okay. Well, being mindful of our time, let's just move to reports. Who is going to report on the stormwater?

Mr. Hurd: That would be me.

Mr. McIntosh: Okay.

Mr. Hurd: Because a third of our group walked out the door.

Mr. McIntosh: He said there was something . . .

Mr. Hurd: Yeah, he had something . . . so the stormwater issue as we saw it is that, of course, the more paved surface you have, the more issues you have with stormwater, the more management you have to do, the more that paved surface affects the quality of the stormwater, and therefore more treatment. So salt and sand and oils and things are getting into the stormwater and have to be treated and removed, etc. So we're . . . I'm trying to think how to summarize this . . . in essence, what we're in favor of is reducing the number of small parking lots scattered throughout the City, which have their own stormwater management issues, in favor of consolidated, larger lots. And whether that means pushing, you know, more traffic towards the City lots, or whether that means a garage, or if that means some other sort of large combined thing, but our feeling was the less spread out parking you have, the better it is from a stormwater management standpoint because then you have, if you have one . . . on that property, at least, all your stormwater is basically coming from your roof. Which is easier to control, much better quality, and easier to manage. Then we're essentially supporting pushing people to the larger lots where you can control it as a single thing. So that is, essentially, that's our report.

Mr. McIntosh: Okay, good. Economics.

Mr. Silverman: We discussed parking as a land use that has its own impact, just as any other use of the land does, whether it's office, commercial, or residential. It's something that has been treated as an afterthought. That it's just kind of there. That it's very difficult to measure, from a government point of view, the cost benefit to the local government. We identified some key things that go in kind of the opposite direction. Land that's devoted to surface parking is not taxed the same as improved land. It's considered unimproved land, so it brings in a basic lower revenue. There are costs associated with that property . . . and the stormwater

management people articulated that . . . both onsite and offsite costs that can result in potential capital improvements. The use of multiple parking lots does impact land use with respect to the number of access and egress curb cuts to get on the public street, requiring a driver to make a move or slow down or come to a stop, which further impacts traffic flow. There was discussion of the overhead cost of parking. Somebody has to pay the mortgage on the acquisition of the land, which is not developed to have a rate of return. They have to pay for the installation of the parking surface and all the surface structure associated with it, and then ongoing operation and maintenance. And that cost is not borne by the property owner. It is simply passed through either in rents or square footage costs to the tenant. There is a potential for mischief, particularly in the private lots that are generally unlit and out-of-sight, out-of-mind after normal hours, when those lots are virtually deserted, which creates a policing problem. The requirement for having parking associated with a parcel creates a number of potential problems with respect to land use. The actual buildable square footage of a lot is reduced by the physical requirement of consuming some of that property with surface parking, which leads to lost tax revenue. In cities very similar to Newark where there is a mixture of structures and aged structures, those cities are finding that by either disconnecting parking, reducing parking requirements, or eliminating parking requirements, there's a tendency to re-use existing buildings and bring them back on the market as modern buildings, increasing the square foot, increasing the assessment cost, increasing the value to the community, and, at least in theory, the economic theory, by creating more square footage within the confines of the City of Newark, we can reduce the cost per square foot, or have the opportunity to reduce the cost per square foot for a leasable area, and potentially reduce the cost for rents. So that's kind of the direction our group took in looking at the positive and negative impacts of parking in Newark.

Mr. McIntosh: Okay. I didn't say this last time. Are there any comments on either of those reports? Any upgrades?

Mr. Silverman: Anyone want to add anything?

Mr. McIntosh: Yeah, that's what I mean.

Mr. Hurd: I actually wanted to throw in two things. One was something I left out of our report which we briefly touch on, which is that although the City is planning to collect a fee for impervious surface on your lot, we do feel that the City should be encouraging people to not be developing as much parking, even though they would lose some money, technically, from the fee, because it would be better for the City to not have the lot in the first place.

To the economics questions, something that popped up in our conversation just in sort of talking about parking minimums and such, if we remove the parking requirements from some buildings, you can perhaps rent to or have other uses. One thing the City does not have nearly any of, is office space because, one, there's a parking requirement for it, and two, you can't get as much rent for it as you can for retail or for residential. So it fits in the spot that no one can afford to put office space into a building. But hopefully without some of the parking requirements, we could start to see more offices in the Main Street downtown area. Which means now you've got employees downtown during the day, keeping it more active and helping with the businesses.

Mr. McIntosh: Anybody else? Okay. In our group we had discussion around the private lots and employee parking. It was a pretty good discussion, I thought. The bottom line was that there are lots that basically circle the City, the downtown area, that is, that could take up parking, particularly at night, nighttime usage, that could relieve any nighttime issue. One of them is beyond our control but not beyond our ability to negotiate, and that's the Newark Shopping Center. Two of the others, I guess all three of the others, are University owned lots. One is the Pearson lot that is right in the middle. Where is that? It's right in the middle. It's walking distance to . . .

Mr. Rind: It's between Haines and Academy.

Mr. McIntosh: And then one at the far end behind the Deer Park area. And then, of course, there's also the garage, the Trabant garage, that's also down in that area. So those three, then, could . . . they're large spaces, and we know that the University is willing and able to join with Newark in making those available at night at much reduced costs from what they are during the day. We would have to negotiate with the Newark Shopping Center, and part of the thinking there was maybe we'd put meters in that lot, and only the portion of the lot that's closest to downtown, to Main Street, that is. So that seemed like a solution.

There was some other talk about utilizing College Square and doing something similar with College Square that we were talking about with Newark Shopping Center. And the key to any of the, or a potential key to any of this, would be the trolley that we were talking about running on a continuous basis. The big thing is taking the employees that work in all the restaurants, in particular . . . it's the predominant business downtown . . . there's a lot of people that the employer is not going to be providing parking for, but may subsidize some parking for their employees. And if we can put them in some of these outer lots, it would be a lot less expensive for them . . . I'm thinking of the employee . . . thus also opening spaces for the customers to come in and have a meal or whatever else it might be that's going on.

So there was also some talk about Trader's Alley and I'm not sure any of us want to get into the middle of that at the moment. If we could solve it some other way, it'd probably be a better deal. But we recognize that it exists and maybe when the Hatfields and the McCoys are done with whatever they're fighting about, we could maybe get something going there. It doesn't appear like we need to, at the moment.

So the idea is to come up with a plan, a package I think Lee used as an example, that we could bring to the Newark Shopping Center and bring to College Square. We've already kind of know what we can do with the University. But, nevertheless, put a package together that we could go and talk to the powers-that-be in those locations and, by extension, talk to other folks like the church. Right? I mean, when are you not using your parking and when could we use it, if we could? And the answer may be, what, are you nuts? And then I would refer that to Alan. Leaving me out of that, for sure. But at any rate, there are private lots all over the City that . . . and yours didn't even show up on here, Rob, if you notice. So I don't know what that means. If this is God's place, leave it alone. I don't know. But, be that as it may, we could negotiate with all of these various owners of private spaces for this package that has . . . we don't have it together right now, but that would be what we would suggest doing. And, frankly, I would think that's not the purview of this committee to do anyway. It would be, you know, the Planning Department and the Parking Commission and people like that to put it together. And then if you needed help from us, or Rich or whatever, and if this committee was no longer functioning, I'm sure all would be willing to help in that regard. But it seems to us that that is a way that we can relieve the nighttime parking. And we may be able to relieve some of the daytime parking by picking off certain places that we might be able to have that same negotiation with. So that was the thrust of our thinking. Did I miss anything?

Mr. Rind: No.

Mr. McIntosh: Alan?

Mr. Silverman: With respect to the private parking, something I'd like to see this committee recommend is that a survey be done of the City's land development codes and City policy that may discourage innovative solutions for private entities getting together and forming parking associations or hiring a contractor to coordinate lots or contract with a private agency that does the kind of thing you're talking about in other jurisdictions. It was brought up by, I believe, Mr. Locke that their particular development philosophy with his organization is if the Code says thou shalt have ten parking spaces, but only five of them are utilized, they remain empty. Yet there is a gray area in the City where another organization may rent out those lots. So maybe

we need to review the Code or have some code changes when we decouple to allow that kind of flexibility. That is there are excess or surplus, or whatever, that private lot owners can voluntarily come together or contract with a group to coordinate and maintain those spaces. So there may be things in our Code that no one is willing to take a chance or are prohibited.

Mr. McIntosh: Okay.

6. PUBLIC COMMENT

Mr. McIntosh: Any other comments? Okay, well I think we've got some . . .

Ms. Gray: I think Dr. Morgan had . . .

Mr. McIntosh: Oh, did you . . .

Dr. Morgan: I would like to say something.

Mr. McIntosh: Put your hand up higher, would you? Geez.

Dr. Morgan: Thank you. John Morgan, District 1. I have resided in the City of Newark ever since I came here, since 1981. And I'd like to make a very general comment on economic development, which is I think it's important to look at the City of Newark as a whole, and as you focus on downtown, as you should, but you should also look at the broader picture. And I say this because a few years ago I went through the University's phone directory when it still was being printed to identify faculty members who lived in the City of Newark. And I found that fewer than half of the University's faculty members actually live in the City of Newark. Some live in other states like Pennsylvania or Maryland, perhaps because of the better school systems. But others just live elsewhere in Delaware. And I think it's fair to say that for an academic, living in a nice college town is a plus. And certainly there is a perception among some citizens that Newark is not a nice college town. Because although it does have a very economically vibrant Main Street now, in contrast to say 25 years ago, it seems to be directed much more toward the crowd of people around the age of 20. There is a resident who lives in my neighborhood who, I think with some exaggeration, described Main Street as the food court for the University. It has an element of truth to it. It is an exaggeration, but it has an element of truth to it, right? And I think that if you want to have a flourishing City of Newark, you want to have a downtown area which is appealing to people in their 30s, 40s, 50s, 60s, 70s, and so on. And that just simply maximizing the economic value of the business area downtown may not be the right thing to do for the town as a whole. Thank you.

Mr. McIntosh: Well said. Well said. I think at the end of the day, the community of Newark is going to have to say we want people to come here, and this is what we're willing to do to make it viable for you to come here. And that is all of these six issues that we've dealt with over the last two months, if they're done properly and ecumenically, right, you know, the people are putting aside their prime interest for the interest of the whole, that we can do that. It's a great place to live. But it can be a lot better. And just doing some of the things where we can get people to come together, sit at the table, and talk about how we can improve, and this is what I need, but this is what we all need. And to the extent that we can do that, then we're going to have a better community. So if we can build maps that will bring people in and they're like, oh yeah, I can find that. I can do this. I can do that. Just make life easier for people to come here and make people believe that this is a destination that they want to be at. And that it's not just for college students. It's for everybody, but including college students. You know, how do you get away from that? There are a lot of them that live here. So, anyway, that's just a comment.

I'm assuming that was the public comment, too, so we'll just wrap that up.

One thing that I think we're heading in the direction that we're heading, Mary Ellen, this is directly to you, we're not going to try to figure out how to do all this, right. I don't think that's

appropriate. But what we're hoping to do is to give you the direction so that you and your staff, who are very competent in what they do, can sit down and figure out what the pluses and minuses, and what do we have to do, and who do we have to get to, and so on. We'll give you the big picture and now you have to put the implementation plan together. I think that's where we're going to be heading next month. You know, what's the big picture? Is there anything else we have to add to that, and so on? And then when we do that, it will be in your hands to create the model, if you will, taking into account all of the things that we've talked about here. If we can do that, I think we are a long, long way down the road to not only solving the parking problem, but going a lot beyond that. Because parking isn't . . . it's an issue. It's why people don't go down there to Wilmington. It's not because of parking, although it's partly because of that. But they're afraid of what's going to happen to them when they go to the lot, the parking lot. I don't think that's so true here. But people don't come here because they don't believe that they can get conveniently to where they want to go. So by solving that, we solve a lot of other things. And so that's just a comment you can noodle over the holidays and make your Christmas just wonderful. Ho, ho, ho. At any rate, it's good work. You know, it's work that you studied to actually do. Go ahead.

Mr. Cappiello: So, from my perspective and from what I would glean to say is the church's perspective, we recognize the University and the students there. And we actively try to engage students on multiple levels to come to the church and do things with us. We find that it's a benefit for them on many levels without making any political or non-political statements. But if anything comes out of this with decoupling or that has an end result of bringing in more families, more permanent residents, not just a student who is going to be here for a couple of years, that's a great plus for us, as well. I mean we would love to see that. Because we have seen, you know, as Chrysler closed, as Avon closed, all those things that kept people in the immediate footprint of Newark, has driven families out. And so we look at that void being filled with the student population. And whether that's someone coming in and buying up a house and saying, well I'll let my children live there and then I'll just use it as a moneymaker and rent it to other kids, we would love to be able to see something that would start bringing it in. If it's businesses, making it more attractive to someone to be able to afford office space in the footprint of downtown Newark. Where someone says, hey, I've got my law firm here so I'm going to live in this footprint and I'm going to raise my kids here. And so now it starts to become more of a balanced community. That would be great for us, too.

Mr. McIntosh: It would be great for everyone. And, quite frankly, cities and communities across the country do this all the time. There's no reason why it can't be done here. You see transformations happen regularly. I think about Baltimore, for instance. Eww. But now, I don't feel that way. I say I want to go there. Before it kind of, you know, why would anybody go there? Well they have to get to Washington. Oh, good reason. So, you know, it happens everywhere. It just requires a committed group of people to bring it together, give up some stuff to get some other stuff. That's the way it is.

So, with that, thank you all for your contributions so far this year. And I guess that will be it for this year. We have a meeting, I think it's the fourth . . .

Ms. Gray: Yes, the fourth Wednesday.

Mr. McIntosh: The fourth Wednesday. We go back on our regular schedule. And if there's any chance that we could get the minutes of this meeting out earlier than a week ahead of time, because it really does take a whole week to read the book.

Ms. Vispi: It takes a long time to type them, too.

Mr. McIntosh: Believe me, I understand. If it were me, I would have it sent out and done, but that's a different matter. Just so the people have a chance to comb through them. Because the next meeting will be a very important meeting. It's taking all this information we have, and

we'll talk about how we might extract from the minutes so that we make that discussion that we have next month, you know, a more efficient one.

Ms. Gray: So my thought is to pull that . . . and we can start doing that from the existing meeting minutes . . . is to pull out all of recommendations and make a summary of the recommendations from all the work groups, and some possible implementation suggestions. And then that way to get that out to everybody. And so that way everyone could go through it and give thoughts to that, to see whether we need to add anything or whether we need to prioritize. And then the next step would be to get everybody's thoughts on that and then that could be pulled into a larger report, if you will, and we could start to put meat on the implementation steps, and then that will be brought forward to the full Planning Commission for their thoughts on that, and then that could be forwarded to Council with decision points all along the way.

Mr. Silverman: Would it be possible to develop a matrix after you've identified ideas and solutions, and within that matrix maybe down-the-road actions that would be taken that are public or private? I work very well from something that's visual and something that's tied to bullet points, kind of thing, rather than just lists.

Ms. Gray: I'd have to work on that. I'm not going to commit to it today. I'm going to commit to some type of articulation of what the summaries are and what next steps need to happen. So whether that's a matrix, I'm not . . .

Mr. Silverman: I understand. If you what you find in reviewing the minutes naturally falls in that direction, that would be my preference, as opposed to just paragraph after paragraph of narrative.

Ms. Gray: Okay.

Mr. McIntosh: Okay, well, again, thank you. Happy holidays. We'll see you in the New Year. Can you just feel like we're getting to the end here? That's great.

Ms. Gray: January 24th is the next meeting.

Mr. McIntosh: January 24th. Alright. January 24th. Oh, I'm busy that day.

There being no further business, the Planning Commission Parking Subcommittee meeting adjourned at 4:14 p.m.

As transcribed by Michelle Vispi
Planning and Development Department Secretary

Attachments

[Exhibit A: Parking in Burlington, Vermont](#)

[Exhibit B: Inventory of Parking Spaces Downtown](#)